

RESTORATIONISM

Overview

Introduction: The Five-Fold Ministry

- Loss & Restoration in Church History
- Restoration of the Apostle and Prophet
- Restored Authority of Apostles & Prophets
- The Goal of the Restored Authority of Apostles & Prophets
- Conclusion

APPENDIX 1: Nicolaitanism

The 1980s: The Prophetic Movement

- Bill Hamon
- The Kansas City Fellowship
- Later Developments in the Prophetic Movement
- 2004: Two Blows
- Some Features of the Prophetic Movement
- How reliable are the new Prophets?

APPENDIX 1: Examples of inaccurate prophecies

APPENDIX 2: Statements by Andrew Strom after his departure from the Prophetic Movement

APPENDIX 3: What is Kundalini?

The 1990s: The Restoration of Apostles & The New Apostolic Restoration

- The UK Restorationist Movement
- The New Charismatic Magisterium
- Restoration of Apostles in the USA: The New Apostolic Reformation
- The Nature of New Apostolic Reformation Apostles
- The Progress of the New Apostolic Reformation
- C Peter Wagner (1930-)
- Wagner & the Fiasco of the June 2008 Todd Bentley Lakeland Commissioning Ceremony
- A Coming Charismatic Inquisition?

APPENDIX 1: International Coalition of Apostles: Prominent members

APPENDIX 2: A Coming Charismatic Inquisition? *Some quotations*

APPENDIX 3: Todd Bentley and Lakeland

INTRODUCTION

The Five-Fold Ministry

In addition to Latter Rain and Kingdom Now/Dominionism/Dominion Theology, the other key influence in the US pentecostal/charismatic scene since the 1960s is Restorationism.

Loss & Restoration in Church History

Restorationism is the belief in a restoration of the original Christianity of the early church.

Its proponents say many true things about the loss and subsequent progressive recovery of the full, original counsel of God in Church history.

They rightly say that soon after its birth, the Church lost its original spiritual life and power. Acceptance of man-made tradition and legalism led to a progressive loss of the Spirit and the Word culminating in the awful darkness of Medieval Romanism.

It is also correct to say that from the Reformation the Church began to recover truths that Catholicism had suppressed or distorted for over 1000 years:

- 16th C, Luther restored justification by faith;
- 18thC, Wesley, the sanctification of the Spirit;
- 19th C, the Brethren, the blessed hope of the glorious appearing of our Lord Jesus Christ;
- 19th C, the Christian & Missionary Alliance, divine healing;
- 20th C, the Pentecostals, the gifts and baptism of the Holy Ghost.

But are Restorationists correct in their teaching about the nature of the most recent stage of the process of restoration? Let us look at this teaching more carefully.

Restoration of the Apostle and Prophet

According to Restorationists, the next thing to be restored is the original five-fold ministry of Eph 4:11, overthrowing the 3-fold order of bishops/priests/deacons inherited from the ecclesiastical governmental system introduced in the 4th C after the Roman Emperor Constantine legalised and favoured Christianity.

In the past, the continuing ministry of apostles and prophets has generally only been accepted by some on the fringes of pentecostal/evangelical Christianity, such as:

- the Catholic Apostolic Church;
- Dowie's Zion Church;
- the UK Apostolic Church (Penygroes); and
- the post war Latter Rain movement (although they were unwilling to give public acknowledgement to those considered to be so gifted).

After the 1960s, however, the idea of apostles and prophets began to move towards the pentecostal/evangelical mainstream.

It started with the UK Restorationist/House Church Movement.

Restorationists criticised the alleged preoccupation of the Charismatic Movement in the 1960s and 1970s with the needs and renewal of the individual. Some UK leaders in the 1970s sought to restore not only the spiritual energy and vitality of the early Church to individuals, but also NT church structures. They aimed to integrate Pentecostal belief in the gifts and baptism of the Spirit with the teaching on the nature of the

Church of the Plymouth Brethren. They formed what became known as the Restorationist Movement, claiming that the authentic original New Testament church order was being restored.

This order centred on the fivefold ministries of Eph 4:11: Apostles, Prophets, Evangelists, Teachers and Pastors. Although the Charismatic Movement brought the gifts of the Spirit to denominational churches, Restorationists considered denominationalism unbiblical, believing the church should be directly governed and empowered by the Spirit. (For fuller details, see my article, "The House Church Movement".)

Restorationists separate the gifts of the Spirit into essential and non-essential. The five offices of Eph 4:11 are essential. They are sometimes called "ascension" or "ministry" gifts and viewed as *the* gifts. (Whilst referring to a 5-fold ministry, the primary focus tends to be on the apostle and prophet.) The rest are profitable but not of the same calibre or authority.

By the 1980s Restorationism had become a serious force in mainstream circles in the USA. Bill Hamon (see next chapter) charts the progressive restoration of the new prophets and apostles:

- The 1980s saw the restoration of prophets to their proper recognition, acceptance and authority in the Church. They would also bring revelation and restoration of the apostle.
- The full restoration of the apostle in the 1990s would bring a restored full apostolic authority and the gift of faith and the working of miracles. The discipleship/shepherding movement of the 1970s glimpsed this truth but there were many abuses. But its restoration in the 1990s would bring unity in the Church.

Restored Authority of Apostles & Prophets

Advocates of the 5-fold ministry believe they are restoring more than simply the offices and ministries of Eph 4:11.

In particular, they emphasise the *authority* of the apostle and prophet, not merely their *ministry*. They consider these two offices essential to establish a new Kingdom-of-God-type government in the Church. They believe they are restoring the true government of the Spirit to a divided, institutionalised Church, bringing the whole Church under "divine government".

Isaiah's prophesy of the government being "upon His [Jesus'] shoulders" (Isa 9:6) is (mis)interpreted as referring to the new arising apostolic leadership. The shoulders are explained as part of His body, and the new apostles and prophets (and by extension, the entire 5-fold ministry) are deemed to be those shoulders.

Is this Biblical? Or is it a Protestant recreation of the old Nicolaitan priesthood? (See Appendix 1 for an explanation of the word "Nicolaitan")

Is there Scriptural Justification for the authority claimed for modern apostles and prophets?

Restorationists justify their teaching of the authority and effect of the 5-fold ministry as follows:

1. Eph 2:20 is said to make apostles and prophets the foundation of the Church
2. Eph 2:20 is then combined with Eph 4:11, to claim that evangelists, pastors and teachers share with apostles and prophets the position as the foundation of the Church

Let us look at this more fully.

Ephesians 2:20

(ye) are built upon the foundation of the apostles and prophets, Jesus Christ himself being the chief corner stone.

This is the key text Restorationists use to make their case. But they interpret "*the foundation of the apostles and prophets*" to mean not only that apostles and prophets *laid* the foundation but that they *were* the foundation of the original early Church form of government.

For example, the following words of Royal Cronquist, attribute powers to latter-day apostles and prophets beyond what is written:

*"Who is the foundation? The apostles and prophets. **Is Jesus Christ the foundation? No.** He is the foundation of all things, but literally, to the church, He is the cornerstone, and upon Him comes the foundation of the apostles and prophets to put the foundation of all doctrine, of all revelation, of all experience, of all truth, of all anointing, of all authority, of all power, not only upon, but under all the people of God... The whole purpose of the foundational ministry, and especially the foundational ministry, is to equip you in a very private, particular way to inform, to undergird, to strengthen, to encourage, to qualify, **to create the will of God for your life.** Can you imagine how the body of Christ is still in the baby infancy stage, because they have really denied the foundation that is to their lives, and if they deny **the foundation of their life**, there is no way that the foundation can be built within them".*

"Your Daily Cross Is Giving Up The Throne Of Self" (Spokane, WA: Love Ministries), p 3

Is Jesus *really* not the believers' foundation? Are apostles and prophets *really* "the foundation of their life"? Do apostles and prophets *really* "create the will of God" for our lives?

Submission to those whom the Holy Ghost has made our overseers is indeed Biblical. But only insofar as they teach and practice truth i.e. the Word. (Cp Heb 13:7 & 17, "Remember them which have the rule over you, **who have spoken unto you the word of God:** whose faith follow... Obey them that have the rule over you, and submit yourselves".) But Restorationists want us to believe all must adhere to their apostles and prophets without question as they are ordained by God to direct our every move.

We find similar teaching from Earl Paulk:

*"Ephesians 2:20 says **the Church is built not on Jesus** (a lot of folk don't know that), but it's built on the apostles and prophets, and Jesus Christ being the chief cornerstone. He's the cornerstone, but the apostles and the ministry of the prophets is the foundation.*

What God is doing today is raising up prophets. ... I believe there are... apostles and prophets God is raising up."

Earl Paulk

"Praise The Lord" Show, Trinity Broadcasting Network, March 4, 1986

So, despite lip service to Jesus as head of the Church:

- the foundation is not Jesus but the apostles and prophets;
- they* are our head, the voice of God to us, the will of God to us;
- submitting to them is submitting to God.

But is this what the Bible says? No! "Other foundation can no man lay than that is laid, which is Jesus Christ" (I Cor 3:11). The **only** foundation is Jesus, not a divine order or apostolic government. And it has already been laid! None other can be laid. But Restorationists like Paulk and Cronquist replace it with one of their own making.

Ephesians 2:20 & Ephesians 4:11

This misinterpretation of Eph 2:20 is then combined with Eph 4:11, where apostles and prophets are two of five ministries who equip the saints. So, it is said that evangelists, pastors and teachers also share with apostles and prophets this position as the foundation of the Church.

But is this what the Bible says? No! Eph 2:20 does not say the Church is built upon the foundation of the five-fold ministry but on the apostles and prophets. Just because apostles and prophets are mentioned in Eph 4:11 along with evangelists, pastors and teachers does not necessarily mean the latter are included in the foundation.

(Incidentally, the precise wording of Eph 4:11 suggests pastor-teachers are one, not two offices. So, we should speak of a *four*-fold, not a *five*-fold ministry.)

The Goal of the Restored Authority of Apostles & Prophets

So, the "restored" modern apostles and prophets seek a shift from one basis of authority (the Word) to another (their revelations); from the priesthood of all believers to the priesthood of apostles and prophets. In brief, nothing less than a Protestant edition of the Catholic Nicolaitan clergy/laity hierarchical structure. It is a new priesthood. It is pure Romanism.

They seek to take control of every church they can, replacing the Headship of Jesus with their own "apostolic authority" and "apostolic government". And it is already happening. Not only has the structure of many fellowships been changed, their core beliefs are also being transformed. More and more are submitting to the authority/covering of the new priesthood. And once done, to contradict or question their revelations is tantamount to contradicting or questioning God Himself.

But what is the goal of this government? What is the purpose of this authority?

To radically redefine Christianity

First of all, this modern 5-fold ministry aims to revolutionise and radically redefine Christianity:

*"What is about to come ... is not just a revival, or another awakening; it is a veritable revolution. The vision was given in order to begin to awaken those who are destined to **radically change the course, and even the very definition of Christianity. The dismantling of organisations and disbanding of some works** will be a positive and exhilarating experience for the Lord's faithful servants. A great company of prophets, teachers, pastors and apostles will be raised up with the spirit of Phineas..."*

Rick Joyner
The Harvest

*"...the most wonderful thing God is doing for us in these last days is raising up and restoring completely apostolic leadership and authority. The hope of the church, the hope of the world, is the apostolic ministry...So here God is raising up a new standard, ... **that's going to radically change the expression, the understanding of Christianity in our generation...God has invited us to have a role in establishing this New Order of Christianity**".*

Paul Cain

" You Can Become the Word!", Vineyard Prophecy Conference, 1989

The Goal

What is the goal of this radical change in the very definition of Christianity? And why are the 5-fold ministries, particularly apostolic leadership and authority, considered so important?

The reason they are considered so important is because it is believed that it is only they who can produce a visibly unified, Global Church. And once that has been done, the final stages of restoration will follow:

- the "glory" will fall;
- the "latter rain" be fully poured out;
- the saints will be perfected, with a visible glory cloud or some other apparition manifested permanently upon them as evidence God has transformed them into spiritual beings, full of wisdom, knowing all things, irresistible and immune from all harm;
- global evangelism will prosper and the harvest be brought in;;
- the kingdom will be established on earth, with the new priesthood extending divine government from the Church to the nations;
- Jesus will then, and only then, return to receive the kingdom.

According to Hamon, restored prophets would reveal the last truth to bring the Church to maturity/perfection and finalise the preparation of the Bride for the return of the Lord. They would form a corporate Elijah, fulfilling Malachi 4:5-6 for the Second Coming just as John prepared the way for the first coming. Judgements executed by the last day prophets and apostles would shake man-made religious Babylonian kingdoms.

Restorationists believe that until the original "divine government" is restored, the body of Christ is out of divine order and will never reach perfection. But full restoration of divine government will lead to glory:

*"And now **my government is in place**, and in a time of great stress I shall bring forth my next step, for Toronto was a step, Brownsville was another step; **my next step will be my glory**, and signs like you have never seen before".*

Bob Jones; 1998,
"The Remnant Seed"

Restorationists do not see apostolic government as a temporary expediency to bring spiritual life to a decaying Church system. It is the Kingdom of God. This divine government/ Kingdom of God must first be fully established *in* the Church, and then, *through* the Church, in the entire world.

At present, they see the most important role of the restored divine government as producing visible unity among as many churches as possible. All dissent and inter-denominational strife must end. Those not co-operating must be removed. Doctrinal differences must be set aside because "doctrine divides".

Until this is achieved, they believe the "glory" cannot fall, nor the "latter rain" be fully poured out, and we cannot bring in the harvest or establish the kingdom. Those unwilling to put aside doctrinal views are hindering global evangelism and our going on to perfection.

Is there Biblical justification for the claimed effects/goals of the Five-Fold Ministry?

Great emphasis is put on Eph 4:7-8, 11-13 in five-fold ministry teaching:

But unto every one of us is given grace according to the measure of the gift of Christ. ... he gave some, apostles; and some, prophets; and some, evangelists; and some, pastors and teachers; for the perfecting of the saints, for the work of the ministry, for the edifying of the body of Christ: till we all come in the unity of the faith, and of the knowledge of the Son of God, unto a perfect man, unto the measure of the stature of the fulness of Christ.

Why do Restorationists place such emphasis on them? Because they refer to three key goals of Restorationism:

- perfecting believers for "the work of the ministry,"
- bringing the body to the "unity of the faith," and
- bringing the body to "a perfect man, to the measure of the stature of the fulness of Christ".

These are indeed beautiful verses and beautiful goals. But is the spirit of the Restorationist interpretation of how these goals can be achieved the Spirit of the Word? Are they correct to claim this passage proves that the 5-fold ministry is indispensable and submission to its authority is required to the attaining of these goals and to bring the Church to perfection?

Let us look at what Cronquist says:

"You therefore shall be complete (AV = perfect), even as your heavenly Father is complete. How do you suppose that is going to be done? ... by holy apostles, prophets, evangelists, pastors, and teachers who become the experience themselves, who equip you with the experience that they have, who give you the rules, the laws, the ways, and the how-tos to literally cooperate with God's Holy Spirit so that it again can be performed."
"Your Daily Cross", p 6

We have already seen how Cronquist and others "prove" (by a misinterpretation of Eph 2:20 & 4:11) that the Church is founded on prophets and apostles and the other five-fold ministries, not on Jesus, and how they will lay another foundation of doctrine, revelation, experience, power and authority. Now, after letting them lay their foundation under us, Cronquist says the new priesthood will first *themselves* become the experience, then show *us* how to become the experience. Then, by submission to their new apostolic "rules", "laws", "ways" and "how-tos", the Church can come to perfection.

So, they, not Scripture, are the final word on what is true and false. There must be no judging of their doctrine, experiences, lifestyles or fund-raising methods; no interpretation of the Word of God apart from their interpretations and teachings.

In short, Eph 4:7-8, 11-13 is used to demolish the current order, establishing a new order that will lead right into the Kingdom age.

Now these verses are indeed inspiring, and the goals they describe beautiful and truly something to be coveted. But, is the Restorationist interpretation of them correct? is this what Eph 4:7-8, 11-13 actually says?

Firstly, the Greek word translated "perfecting" in verse 11 means, fully furnish or equip. There is a difference between equipping and perfecting.

- If the meaning is **equipping**, the focus is not on the equippers, but on those being equipped, and what they do once equipped. And this ties in exactly with verse 12. This clearly states that, once equipped, it is the saints, not the 5-fold ministry, who minister to and edify the rest of the body until we reach the beautiful goals of verse 13.
- But if the meaning is **perfecting**, it is the five-fold ministry that becomes the focus. It is needed all the way to perfection. This reinforces a clergy/ laity system.

Furthermore, the Restorationist interpretation of this verse implies the sheep are to be perfected indirectly, by Christ in the 5-fold ministry, but the shepherds directly, by the Spirit. So, whilst Jesus is *their* head, *they* become *our* head. Is this not Biblical? No. Jesus is our head. We are all perfected directly by the renewing and sanctification of the Spirit, the power of godliness. Any other teaching is Romanism.

Secondly, the verses following this passage, Eph 4:14-16, do not support the Restorationist interpretation:

That we ... may grow up into him in all things, which is the head, even Christ: From whom the whole body fitly joined together and compacted by that which every joint supplieth, according to the effectual working in the measure of every part, maketh increase of the body unto the edifying of itself in love.

These say that the body is to grow into and draw directly *from Christ*, the Head. It is *from Him* that it receives what is needed to edify itself. It is joined together and compacted, not only by the five gifts mentioned in Eph 4:11, but by that which *every joint* supplies, according to the effectual working of *every part*.

The goal of all true ministers is to work themselves out of a job. Gifted ones are to help the saints get the "supply" with which *they* supply the rest of the body, not to build themselves a Nicolaitan kingdom.

Conclusion

Having looked at the broad principles of Restorationism, let us now look in more detail at the recent rise of the two key restored ministries in the next two chapters:

- The 1980s: The Prophetic Movement, and
- The 1990s: The Restoration of Apostles & The New Apostolic Restoration

APPENDIX 1

Nicolaitanism

The word “Nicolaitane” is only found in Scripture in two of the letters to the 7 churches:

*But this thou hast, that thou hatest the deeds of the Nicolaitanes which I also hate (Rev 2:6).
So hast thou also them that hold the doctrine of the Nicolaitanes, which thing I hate (Rev 2:15).*

Clearly the deeds and doctrine of these people are things the Lord detests. But who are the Nicolaitans?

A brief answer is given below with an extract from my book “The Ephesus and Smyrna Church Ages”. But to really appreciate the foul depths of this spirit, and why the Lord hated both the deeds and the doctrine of the Nicolaitans, it is necessary to read the first four ages in detail.

Who are the Nicolaitanes?

Several explanations have been given.

Some claim “Nicolaitane” is the Greek translation of Balaam. But the former means literally, conqueror of the people, and the latter, corrupter of the people. Furthermore, in Revelation 2:14-15, those holding the doctrine of the Nicolaitans are clearly distinguished from those holding the doctrine of Balaam.

Others say the Nicolaitans were a sect springing from Nicholas, one of the seven chosen to serve at the tables (Acts 6:5), who they claim later apostatised. It is said this sect was characterised by sensuality, seducing Christians to unchastity and participation in idolatrous pagan feasts. They taught that sensuality must be known by experience in order to master it, and thus abandoned themselves without reserve to the lusts of the body. The problem with this interpretation is that, at best, it is only a tradition.

However, by simply interpreting the word “Nicolaitans” according to its literal meaning (“conquerors of the people”), a remarkable similarity is found between this literal sense, and those forces at work in the early Church which brought about her subsequent decline.

The growth of Nicolaitanism from deeds into a doctrine

Understood in this way, the Nicolaitane spirit is basically that spirit which seeks to seduce the people from the direct rule of God through His Spirit, progressively interposing a humanised government between God and the people.

The testimony of the Ephesus age is that they hated the deeds of the Nicolaitans. But it is clear that this spirit was not wholly banished, for by the third Church age (Pergamos) these deeds of Revelation 2:6 had developed so far as to have been properly formulated and systematised into a doctrine (Revelation 2:15).

The initial hatred of Nicolaitanism had gone. The Church now actually tolerated those holding this doctrine within her ranks. The Greek word “hold” means “to hold fast, not to discard, or let go; to keep carefully and faithfully”. Hence the Williams and Amplified translations render “hold” in Revelation 2:15 as “are clinging to”. These men, therefore, were not simply considering this thought - they held to it tenaciously, and propagated it in the Church of God as a properly constituted doctrine possessing the authority of the Word Itself.

The 1980s

THE PROPHETIC MOVEMENT

According to its proponents, in the 1980s God restored prophets to the Church, and in the 1990s along with prophets, apostles began to be recognised as foundational ministries of the Church with ministers and churches seeking God's government, order, and apostolic miracles in local churches and ministries.

These ministries were said to be bringing a new dimension that would result in the perfection of the saints in holiness and power, accompanied by great signs and wonders. They would bring divine order and authority, the apostles bringing a "special governmental anointing" to radically reform the Church, redefining Christianity.

Prophecy was already a feature of pentecostal and charismatic practice and had been experienced sporadically in earlier times of revival.

In the USA, however, it gained new impetus in the 1980s. It took the form of a distinct movement and entered many charismatic churches, the fastest growing in the world according to church growth researchers.

Some key figures in the modern Prophetic Movement are:

- Bill Hamon, particularly from 1979 on;
- The Kansas City Prophets (Paul Cain, Bob Jones, Mike Bickle, James Goll, John Paul Jackson and Lou Engle. Cain and Jones were the elder statesmen.) in the mid/late 1980s;
- Others such as Rick Joyner from the late 1980s, Rodney Howard-Browne, James Ryle, Earl Paulk and many within the Vineyard movement.

These modern prophets profess "new revelations" of the end-time, hitherto not understood by the Church. It is claimed a "New Breed" of Apostles and Prophets is being raised up to lead the Church to take dominion and to execute God's judgements in the world. Former Vineyard Apostle, Jack Deere, even believed the two witnesses of Revelation 11 might be Kansas City Prophets, Paul Cain and Bob Jones. ("Joel's Army," cassette, 1990, Vineyard Ministries)

Says Cain:

"God is raising up a new standard, a new banner if you will, that's going to radically change the expression, the understanding of Christianity in our generation...God has invited us to have a role in establishing this NEW ORDER of Christianity...God is offering to this generation something He has never offered to any other generation... Beware lest OLD ORDER brethren rob you and steal this hope from you!

Vineyard Prophecy Conference, 1989

Says Jones about this *new hope*:

"I have called the best of every blood line in earth unto this generation...I have elected to bring them forth in this generation...THE ELECT GENERATION...even the bloodline of Paul...of David...of Peter, James and John...They will even be superior to them in heart, stature and love for me...Your children will possess the spirit without measure...They will move into things of the supernatural that no one has ever moved in before...coming into the DIVINE NATURE of Jesus Christ...a Church that has reached the full maturity of the GODMAN! This generation...is going to see the beginning of this WORLD WIDE NEW ORDER."

Bob Jones, Vineyard Prophecy Conference, 1989,
cited in "The New Order," by van der Merwe, p 7

Let us look in more detail at Bill Hamon and the Kansas City Prophets.

Bill Hamon

Hamon is very influential in the apostolic-prophetic movement, and considered by many as the father of the Prophetic Movement.

The apostolic-prophetic movement's most prominent leader is C Peter Wagner. Yet Wagner admits he got many of his views from Hamon, describing him as one of his "closest prophetic colleagues" (see his foreword to Hamon's *Apostles, Prophets and the Coming Moves of God*). Hamon serves on the faculty of the Wagner Leadership Institute.

Hamon has been in the prophetic ministry since the 1950s, and has dedicated much of his ministry to the restoration of the prophetic office. He oversees over 600 churches in 19 countries, conducts seminars on how to prophesy, and has authored several influential books, including *Prophets and the Prophetic Movement*.

Background

- In 1952, aged 18, Hamon attended a Latter Rain-influenced church.
- In 1953 he says he first had the revelation of the end time ministry of prophets, when it was prophesied he would be a prophet.
- For the next 26 years he taught, held "prophetic presbyteries" and ministered individually as a prophet.
- He says his calling forth a prophetic people did not begin until 1979, despite ministering in personal prophecy. He then began to teach, train, and activate others in the gifts of the Spirit. (According to Hamon, although many had upheld the prophetic ministry since the 1950s, this was not the same as the Prophetic Movement.)
- In 1981 he published "The Eternal Church", then three books on prophets and the prophetic ministry for the anticipated end-time company of prophets to restore the ministries of prophet and apostle in the 1980s and 1990s.
- In 1982 he began regular prophets' conferences in USA and overseas.
- In 1984 he began seminars where a prophetic presbytery was provided.
- By 1987 the Christian International Ministries Network (CI) staff led prophetic teams.

In 1987 Hamon held what he considered the first national prophets' conference. An international conference followed in 1988 when he believed the Prophetic Movement was brought to birth, with prophetic structures arising all over the world to lead God's people out of religious bondage. Hamon believed his task was to bring unity and networking among the different prophetic camps.

CI trained and activated thousands across the world to gather a company of end-time prophets. The networking of ministers and churches for relationship, oversight, and accountability added a new dimension of covering for those relating to CI. In 1992, CI Network of Churches was formed to meet that need with an apostle/prophet team ministry, while pursuing excellence in all 5-fold ministries.

In addition to "Bishop" and "Doctor," Hamon calls himself "Prophet-Apostle." He believes God has chosen him to restore doctrines lost to the Church through the ages & to reveal final assignments and new doctrines.

But what are those doctrines?

Protestants believe Christians get their teachings from the Bible alone. But Hamon believes modern apostles and prophets give new doctrines that supplement those of the original apostles and prophets.

In *Apostles, Prophets and the Coming Moves of God* (p 140), Hamon says:

"[Paul] reveals that this anointing for divine revelation was not just given to the prophets of old but has now been **equally** given to Christ's Holy Apostles and Prophets in His Church."

Hamon's Teachings

According to Hamon,

- **The Charismatic Movement** was God's opportunity to all denominations to be established in the truths and experiences restored since the Reformation.
- **The Latter Rain Movement** brought the revelation of prophets in the Church today.
- **The Prophetic Movement** (which includes prophets, gifts, personal prophecy and prophetic people, presbytery, worship and song) activated and reproduced those prophets. The Movement was birthed in the 1980s and was expected to come to full maturity and manifestation in the 1990s.

Prophets were the key to unlock the revelation of the times, and of Christ's restorative purpose and the things the Church must accomplish before Jesus returns. Their restoration was essential to fulfill God's full purpose for the Church. They had now entered a warfare that would not cease until the Church possessed the inheritance preordained for the perfected Church, and the kingdoms of this world became the kingdoms of our Lord and His Church.

But the Prophetic Movement had to be seen in the overall context of God's eternal purpose. It is not an end in itself but a means to an end, to fulfill His ultimate purpose for His Church and the earth.

The full 5-fold ministry had to be functioning to equip the saints to bring the Body to full maturity and the full stature of Christ before Jesus can return. Overcomers must come to maturity and ministry.

Before the Second Coming, God would send times of refreshing (Acts 3:19-21), i.e. many restoration movements. These times of restitution would come *before* (rather than *when*) Jesus returns, i.e. He will not/cannot return until those movements have fulfilled their mission.

The Prophetic Movement was not the last restoration movement. Another would restore the apostle. Then one final move. The prophets claimed to see a wave of restoration greater than anything ever seen, the mightiest ever, greater than all since the Reformation, fulfilling Rev 10:7 and the restitution of all things (Acts 3:19). Although the world would become more wicked and antichrist would arise, the true Church would triumph. The final move would bring the Church to full maturity, sweeping across the nations like a giant 1000-foot tidal wave.

The role of the Prophetic Movement in the overall plan of restoration was:

- To enlighten and direct the Church into a full possession of her Canaan inheritance.
- To bring recognition of the need to network in a unity of faith, under divine order and apostolic covering.
- To bring purity and maturity to the Body.
- To prepare the Bride to be presented to the Bridegroom, making ready a people for the coming of the Lord. A company of prophets in the Spirit and power of Elijah would equip the Church and prepare the way for the second coming just as John the Baptist came in the Spirit of Elijah to prepare the way for the first coming.
- To raise up an army, under the leadership of modern apostles and prophets, for the Day of the Lord, equipping the saints in their weapons of warfare, including the gifts of the Spirit. The Bride has been dressed in her garment of praise. Now it is time to train her in her weapons of warfare. Christ cannot return until a "militant" army is formed to subdue the earth and begin to establish God's kingdom in the earth's governments. He likens this army to the Crusaders, who he describes as the Church's only bright light during the Dark Ages. Those refusing to equip the saints will be removed from leadership or the hungry will leave their churches.
- To testify of and demonstrate the kingdom. Prophetic evangelism will reveal the secrets of the hearts and cause men to fall down and confess, turning whole nations to God, as with Daniel.
- To consummate their ministry by bringing about the end of the present world system, putting under foot all the enemies of Christ and preparing the way for His release to descend literally from heaven to set up His kingdom on earth in our generation.

According to Hamon, the coming army would execute God's judgements in this last move in and through the Church. It will achieve victory, in part, by striking God's enemies with blindness and calling down natural disasters, causing entire nations to convert. All members of the army will become sinless and extremely powerful as they become more and more enlightened through new doctrines from the apostles and prophets, finally attaining immortality. The apostles and prophets will be so powerful Christians who come into their presence with sin in their lives will be struck dead. (See Hamon's book *Apostles, Prophets and the Coming Moves of God.*)

There will not only be intercessory prayer, warfare praise and prophetic praying and praising. Prophets will confront spiritistic groups. There will be public confrontations by an Elijah company of prophets, probably in settings like TV chat shows. It will be like Moses and the sorcerers. They will speak the creative word.

They will also prophesy to national leaders. A Joseph and Daniel prophetic company will arise with supernatural answers for needs which will bring the wrath of the world systems on restored apostles and prophets. These will prophesy and execute judgements on the world systems as in Rev 11:3-6. They will proclaim the coming of the great and dreadful day of the Lord, executing God's judgements.

The last message before the Second Coming will be the gospel of the kingdom (Matt 24:14). These prophetic saints shall fulfil Matt 6:10 preaching and demonstrating the kingdom over all the earth (Dan 7:18, 22, 27) with apostolic power, reaping the last great harvest of Lk 14:16-23. The Church is the stone Daniel saw hewn out the mountain (Christ) which will bring down world empires fulfilling Dan 2:44 and Rev 11:15.

According to Hamon, when the prophets echo on earth the trumpet sound of the message of the 7th angel in heaven, all the mysteries of God will be revealed and made known to the Church. Fullness of truth, in the days of the voice of the 7th angel, will bring fullness of anointing and power to fully possess our promised possessions.

A brief analysis of these teachings

All very gripping and inspiring. But is it Biblical? Here are a few observations:

- Hamon speaks of entire nations being converted. But in Lk 18:8, Jesus asked, "when the Son of man cometh, shall he find faith on the earth?" And in 2 Th 2:3, Paul warns of end time apostasy in the Church.
- Hamon speaks of a coming **company** of prophets in the Spirit and power of Elijah, an Elijah company of prophets, to equip **the Church** and prepare the way for the second coming. But Mal 4:5-6 speaks of **one man**, Elijah the prophet, coming to **Israel**.
- Hamon claims the Church is the stone hewn out the mountain (Christ) which will bring down world empires (Dan 2:44) and that Christians shall preach and demonstrate the kingdom over all the earth (Dan 7:18, 22, 27). But the book of Daniel speaks of the prophetic future of Daniel's people, Israel, not the Church. The saints referred to are Jews.
- Hamon says his Elijah **company** of prophets will prophesy and execute God's judgements on the world systems as in Rev 11:3-6, proclaiming the coming of the great and dreadful day of the Lord. But Rev 11:3-6 refers to the ministry of **two** prophets/witnesses. And these minister to Israel in the tribulation in the war with the beast.
- Hamon speaks of the Church subduing the earth and beginning to establish God's kingdom in the earth's governments; and of the kingdoms of this world becoming the kingdoms of our Lord and His **Church** as the Church fulfils Rev 11:15. But this verse says they become the kingdoms of our Lord and His **Christ**. It is about Jesus, not the Church, taking the kingdom.
- Hamon likens his coming army to the Crusaders, whom, astonishingly, he describes as the Church's only bright light during the Dark Ages. If that is the type of light we can expect from his coming army, pity those who seek to measure all things by the Word! The spirit of his army may be closer to that of the papal-inspired Crusaders than he realises!

Kansas City Fellowship

Origins (1980s)

One of the most significant catalysts of the Prophetic Movement, and the explosion in prophetic ministry, was the Kansas City Fellowship (KCF) started by Mike Bickle.

Bickle was a young pastor in St. Louis from 1976 to 1982.

In June 1982 a stranger, Augustine Acala, impressed Bickle by his seeming accuracy and so Bickle accepted him as one sent by God to give him direction. Acala prophesied the Lord would redirect his path into something completely new. He came to believe this meant a move to Kansas City.

In September, Bickle said he had an encounter with what he believed to be the Lord Himself. A holy presence filled the room and he heard 'the audible voice of God'. He was trembling, never having experienced anything like it. God told him the work was to be built on 'four standards': (1) Night and day prayer; (2) Holiness of heart; (3) Unwavering faith; and (4) Extravagant giving to the poor. The work would 'touch the ends of the earth' but he must guard against those who would try to 'tone it down'. The voice also strongly emphasised: 'I am going to change the understanding and expression of Christianity in the earth in one generation'.

Shortly afterwards, Acala prophesied about the new movement Bickle was starting:

- "...thousands of young people will rally around this movement..."
- "...full manifestation of the gifts of the Holy Spirit..."
- "...a false prophet will arise in your midst from the very beginning..."
- "...there will be those who will rise up against this movement..."

In November 1982, Bickle, moved to Kansas City to begin a work and in December formed the KCF, believing he was beginning a "special movement" that would touch the ends of the earth.

It's hard to pinpoint exactly when Bickle embraced "Kingdom Now" theology as there are conflicting accounts about what was believed, when, and by whom, in the early days. It seems his brother-in-law who moved with him, introduced the idea of a "new order" of believers in December 1982. But one fact is very revealing. He had been exposed to Restorationism. So, he was already actively seeking to establish God's kingdom on earth before the return of the Lord.

In St Louis he had pastored a "Covenant" church, part of a network overseen by a British "apostle", Bryn Jones, the prominent UK Restorationist leader who openly advocated the establishment of God's kingdom on earth now. So, Bickle had met Kingdom Now theology even before he heard the voice that told him God had chosen him to start a new, end-time movement that would "touch the ends of the earth" and that would "change the understanding and expression" of Christianity all over the world.

We may never know how much Bickle had embraced Restorationism by the time he started KCF. But it began to be preached a few months later in 1983, with the arrival of another "prophet", Bob Jones.

Despite initial fears that Jones may be the predicted false prophet, after seeing the power he displayed and hearing of his many visions, dreams and supernatural experiences, Bickle accepted him as a true prophet. Jones was considered one of the most powerful of the KCF "prophets".

(According to Randles, around 1975 "Jones professed to have the ability to feel in his hands and arms sensations that would signal various spiritual realities." His senses were so inspired he could detect what was happening in the spiritual realm by 20 or 30 signs in his body. He claimed a special gift which demonstrated that people's prayers were being heard, particularly for healing: his hands turned blue then purple, signifying incense had gone up. (Interestingly, Alice Bailey, a New Age practitioner, describes violet or purple light as a catalyst for healing.))

Jones played a key role in the early days, establishing the KCF foundations prophetically. He imparted faith to the hearts of the young people there in his revelation of a new breed of end-time ministers, super-anointed, practically immortal, who would usher in the Kingdom of God.

In 1986 Grace Ministries was formed, an umbrella organisation of mainly KCF men engaged in itinerant ministries dedicated to church planting and intercession and designed to lead to the emergence of a new breed of end-time prophets into the church. Its main facets were:

- **Apostolic teams**, comprised of men with apostolic and prophetic ministries, along with evangelists, pastors and teachers, aimed to plant churches, preferably working within existing churches.
- These teams attempted to establish **City churches**, merging other congregations under their leadership, based on a belief there should be only one church in a city, with several congregations under one eldership.
- **The House of Prayer**, with congregations divided into 24 hours intercessory groups, praying for an outpouring of the Spirit with signs and wonders through prophetic and apostolic ministries.
- **The Joseph Company**, feeding the poor, especially in the 3rd world.
- **The Israel Mandate**, an outreach to facilitate the fulfilling of an expected end time harvest of individual Jews. (NB this did not necessarily imply that Israel will be restored as a *nation*.)
- **Ministry Training Centre**, a Bible school
- **Shiloh Ministries**, a place for novice and experienced prophets to come together, sharing their revelations and understandings of God's purposes. National seminars and conferences were held. Wimber and the Vineyard later played a key role in establishing the basic principles and practices. Paul Cain was another major influence.

Despite using the terms apostle and prophet, Bickle claimed to be hesitant to designate individuals as such. Concerning prophets, despite contradictory evidence, he professed not to recognise the current leaders as full-fledged prophets because they were not near 100% accurate:

"There's no one in our midst that we give the title "prophet". The only one I would feel comfortable of giving that office would be Paul Cain, but he refuses to accept it". ... "We asked tactfully if any of them was ever wrong. They all agreed they had occasionally been proved wrong. Sometimes their revelation was right but their interpretation or application was wrong."
"Some Said It Thundered", Pytches

Prophecies that failed were explained away or blamed on unbelief. One man was told he would become a famous end-time minister, but 2 weeks later was killed in a car accident. The prophecy was edited out of the tape recording. In another case, a woman was told her divorce would not become final and she would not lose custody of her daughter. Both failed. This kind of thing was evident from the very beginning.

In April 1987, the Kansas City prophets (KCP) (as they came to be called) first met Paul Cain. In May he visited their building, and said he immediately recognised it from a vision as the place where the Lord would have a spiritual training centre for the soldiers of Joel's army which He was raising up for the coming revival. (For fuller details, see the chapter on the Latter Rain, and particularly the sections on Paul Cain and Cain's Joel's Army Teaching)

Bickle, Jones and others received Cain as a "spiritual father". He was recognised as chief among the prophets because of his perceived nearly always accurate ability to see things no one else could. He was invited to join the KCF leadership team and adopted as a leading prophet of the group.

Problems (1990s)

After a while things began to go wrong. Many were deeply hurt and wounded.

KCF tended to infiltrate or split existing churches, influencing entire congregations to join them (hence their phenomenal growth), alienating many area churches who claimed they aggressively sought to take over existing churches and to establish KCF as the central church for Kansas City. Evil was prophesied upon churches not disbanding according to instructions from their prophets to make the one-city-one-eldership a reality.

The KCP were featured in a very negative light in *Charisma*, a magazine providing news, analysis, prophetic commentary and teachings for charismatic and Pentecostal Christians. Ernest Gruen, a respected local pastor and father of the Charismatic Movement in that area, in co-operation with other area churches, prepared a very damning report about them. It was compiled from thousands of teaching

documents, books, and tapes of the KCF leaders; eyewitness accounts; and testimonies from pastors who had their churches stolen from them.

This report was not the first course of action. As early as 1984 the KCF leadership was contacted about the concerns. After several failed attempts at correction, they were made public in a sermon in January 1990 accusing KCF of sending out false prophets, of "prophesying" area churches would close down (and then join KCF), and of outright lying. Bickle wrote an "open letter" saying KCF's church structure and the nature of their prophetic ministries were misunderstood. He also claimed most of the sermon was not based on fact and the rest seriously misrepresented the truth. This prompted national distribution of the 223-page document.

Bickle agreed to a July meeting with prominent members of the Charismatic movement. But before the meeting, John Wimber offered his services as sole mediator.

Who was Wimber?

John Wimber (1934 – 1997) & The Vineyard

Wimber was converted in 1963. He attended a Quaker church in California, leading hundreds to Christianity. By 1970, he was leading 11 different Bible study groups involving over 500 people.

In 1974 he was invited by C Peter Wagner to be Founding Director of the Department of Church Growth at the Fuller Theological Seminary Institute of Evangelism and Church Growth. His studies of church growth in the 3rd world led him to revise his previous evangelical/cessationist views. He became convinced of the need for power evangelism, as opposed to programme, with signs and wonders.

While in Fuller, a house group had begun in his home, embracing some Charismatic beliefs. This led to a split with the Quaker church. Wimber left Fuller in 1978 and became their pastor to test his new ideas on growth in practice. His faith in the supernatural grew, and as it did, the new church outgrew his home. He initially joined Calvary Chapel, but left over differences relating mainly to the practice of spiritual gifts. They joined a small group of churches known as Vineyard Christian Fellowships.

In 1981, after a dramatic meeting in his church, Wimber came to accept further manifestations of the moving of the Spirit. Yet despite his belief that God reveals himself in healings and the supernatural, he held firmly to the supremacy of the Scriptures and his teaching was broad based and expository.

In the same year, Fuller accepted his now famous course on "Signs, Wonders & Church Growth", based on experience in his home church, emphasising evangelism with signs following and hands on "training" clinics in signs, wonders and, healings etc to put the teaching into practice. Wimber was able to teach his blend of what he had learned of church growth from Fuller colleagues such as Wagner who had worked in 3rd world countries, together with the ideas of G E Ladd on the kingdom of God as both a present experience through the Spirit of the blessings of the world to come, as well as a future hope of the coming of the kingdom in fulness. (In 1985 the course was suspended as it was too Pentecostal for many of the staff of the Reformed-minded school.)

Wagner had recommended the course as Wimber's approach could enable evangelicals who had chosen not to identify with classic Pentecostals or Charismatics to accept healing and other gifts. Whereas the latter had emphasised tongues as the only evidence for the baptism of the Spirit, Wimber taught it as just one of the gifts. This new approach led Wagner to coin the phrase, "The Third Wave of the Holy Spirit" which he saw as distinct from, whilst very similar to, the first (the Pentecostals) and the second (the charismatics). The Wimber-Vineyard was an example of the third. It revolutionised what was a major theological stumbling block to some mainstream Evangelicals, the demonstration of "signs and wonders" in the present-day in a form alleged to be akin to those of the 1st C apostles.

So, while considered by many to be a charismatic, Wimber himself (along with the leaders of the Vineyard) repeatedly rejected this label.

By the early 1980s, the number of Vineyard churches had grown rapidly, forming a denomination. It now has around 1500 churches in the USA and overseas, including the UK.

Since the mid 1980s, Wimber became a well-known international charismatic conference speaker with a focus on "Power Evangelism" and healing through the power of the Holy Spirit.

Wimber rejected of the Word of Faith movement, and the associated doctrines and showiness. Authenticity was central to Wimber's idea of church, and this was reflected in the worship as well.

His ministry injected a fresh sense of direction to the charismatic movement at a time when it was perceived by some to be running out of steam.

The Vineyard Link

Wimber's offer to mediate was soon followed by Bickle agreeing to submit all KCF ministries to Wimber's oversight. Gruen released the situation into Wimber's hands. Wimber issued some cautions and promised to rein in the most controversial KCP activities, such as the attempts to establish city churches.

By 1991 Bickle fully joined the Vineyard, renaming his church "Kansas City Metro Vineyard Fellowship". Cain called Wimber his lifelong mentor and father, saying he was "bonded to him for life" and claiming the Lord had told him this was a priority of the Spirit.

But Wimber was not qualified to mediate. The KCF leadership had been involved with Wimber and the Vineyard for over a year before the sermon and the report. He had become close to Cain and Bickle.

- Wimber and Vineyard were the major financial contributors to the Shiloh project even before the KCF Vineyard link.
- In 1988, on a trip to Scotland, Bickle had convinced Wimber to change the Vineyard emphasis to that of a prophetic ministry
- In January 1989 Cain met the Vineyard leadership in Anaheim, California, including Jack Deere and Wimber, a meeting supposedly confirmed to Wimber by earthquake signs.
- Wimber viewed Cain as the greatest prophet living today. On 19 February 1989, in "Speaking on Paul Cain and the Office of the Prophet," Wimber said: "he's interacting in two dimensions continually. He's not only seeing you and talking to you, but he's hearing from God constantly. He could ... be in one room and be listening to the conversation ... in another place at the same time."
- Wimber was so impressed with the KCP that In August 1989 he publicly called for every Vineyard pastor to sit under their teaching and be ministered to by them
- In 1990 Wimber wrote, "prophecy is now assuming centre stage in the Vineyard... it is almost all that is talked about." Since first meeting the KCP, he had changed his somewhat sceptical attitude to prophecy. He had been attracted and astounded by seeing "prophetic ministries operate at a level I never imagined possible".

Lack of prophetic accuracy did not trouble Wimber. "Prophecy's first expressions will likely be infantile," wrote Wimber in the Vineyard's autumn 1989 magazine devoted to embracing the prophetic movement. "Babies are messy and they make messes." He referred to the KCP as prophets until the controversy became such that he then stated they merely had a "prophetic ministry".

After the KCF-Vineyard link, things developed quickly. Wimber took the KCF ministry on a world tour, introducing them to UK Christian leaders, promoting the prophets and their doctrines under the umbrella of the Vineyard.

Already, in July 1990, UK evangelical leaders, including the Evangelical Alliance, had stated their support for the KCP saying "we have no doubt about the validity of their ministry". Their UK profile was raised further by the 1990 publication of "Some said it thundered" by UK charismatic Anglican Pytches. It told of his involvement with the KCP and recommended their ministry.

After the KCF submitted to Wimber, the two chief prophets, Jones and Cain, soon terminated their Vineyard/KCF links.

Cain, in 1991-93, courted English churches and joined Westminster Chapel, severing his "lifelong" bond with Wimber and calling Dr R T Kendall his new soul mate. Kendall called Cain a "24-carat man of God". In October 1993 they held "The Word and the Spirit" meetings at Wembley. In 1996 their book of the same title was released to facilitate unity between charismatic and reformed evangelical traditions.

As for Jones, in November 1991 he was exposed in a moral scandal and removed from public ministry by Vineyard/KCF. That year, Bickle stood alongside Wimber at a London leaders' conference as he read a statement of apology.

Jones was later rehabilitated and again recognised as a prophet. He is still active with the support of Rick Joyner. In 1992, Jones left Kansas to become involved in Joyner's MorningStar ministry, which started to become the centre of the prophetic world from the mid 1990s.

Rick Joyner

- Joyner acknowledged a shallow personal relationship to the Lord, leaving the ministry in 1980. He drifted until 1987 when "called back into ministry by the Lord with the word that [his] commission would be given to another if [he] did not return at that time."
- In the late 1980s he became known as a prophet/teacher. In 1989 he authored "The Harvest", a 224 page prophecy foretelling a coming great move of the Spirit, preceded by a complete dismantling of the old order. Since then his prophecies have received wide acceptance and his Morning Star Prophetic Journal been widely read.
- Joyner was never part of the Vineyard, nor the Kansas City movement.
- In the late 1990s he issued "The Final Quest", a 158 page prophecy. It refers to a soon coming Christian civil war between the Blues (those operating by revelation knowledge) and the Greys (those operating out of their heads), who seek to hold the Church in spiritual bondage, such as the oppression of women.
- In 2004 he bought the former Heritage Centre of Jim & Tammy Bakker of The PTL Club.

In 1992 & 1993 Leonard Ravenhill was the KCP Convention keynote speaker. He brought great awe and deep repentance. He declined to speak in 1994, however, confiding to Clayt Sonmore that it was futile to pour new wine into structures of man's own will.

End of the Vineyard Link

In January 1994 the "Toronto Blessing" and its manifestations broke out, vigorously supported by Bickle. In 1995, John Arnott, pastor of Toronto Vineyard, visited Kansas City Metro Vineyard Fellowship.

Wimber's plea to end the Toronto ministry to resolve criticism of its increasingly bizarre manifestations was rejected. He disfellowshipped the Toronto Vineyard to resolve the ongoing criticism. Half the Fellowship left Vineyard. In 1996 Bickle, too, took his church out of the Vineyard in sympathy, and renamed it "Metro Christian Fellowship".

Wimber's link with Kansas City was brief, but it caused alarm among his supporters while it lasted.

In September 1996 Cain prophesied to Toronto pastors, John and Carol Arnott: "The Lord has initiated the Toronto Blessing, not man...He has refreshed His people in order to prepare them for the next level of visitation...." He called on the Kansas fellowship to return to its prophetic roots. In 1997 Cain moved to Kansas City to make the church his home church and started the Shiloh Retreat Centre.

In 1997 Wimber died. Some implied it was a judgement for his criticism of Toronto.

In 1999, Bickle started a new ministry called "International House of Prayer" (IHOP). In 2000, he handed the pastorate of Metro Christian Fellowship to Floyd McClung, former YWAM international director, to concentrate on IHOP and Shiloh Ministries, under his umbrella organisation, "Friends of the Bridegroom Ministry".

So, to sum up about Bickle, KCF founder, from his early years in a small Covenant-type church, he was exposed to Restorationism. From its inception KCF was seen as a catalyst to change the entire structure of the Church, and his apostolic teams were designed to lead to the emergence of a new breed of end-time prophets in the church. (Concerning end time prophecy, however, according to Dager, in an interview no later than 1995, Bickle stated unequivocally his belief in a premillennial return. So, by implication he rejected the establishing God's kingdom before and without the literal return of Jesus. He did not believe the Church would take control of world governments and rejected Reconstructionism. If

true, he was unaware at that time of the extent of Manifest Sons of God influence on the prophets at Grace Ministries.)

Later Developments in the Prophetic Movement

Despite the KCF problems and the departure of some of the chief "prophets", the Prophetic Movement did not die out. It was much bigger than KCF. A significant factor was the near merging of the Prophetic Movement and Toronto streams.

According to Andrew Strom, an insider, manifestations mania first flooded the Prophetic Movement in 1994/95, with Toronto (1994 - late 1990s), Brownsville/Pensacola (1995-2000), a strange mixture of repentance preaching and Toronto manifestations, and Sunderland (1994-95). The Prophetic Movement and Toronto became almost one movement.

The source of Toronto was S African prosperity preacher, Rodney Howard-Browne. His "anointing" was taken by the pastor to the Toronto Vineyard Airport church in early 1994, with its laughing, blowing, barking, jerking and shaking. It soon spread over the USA, UK, Australia and N Zealand.

Although Toronto was expelled from the Vineyard in December 1995, very few charismatic leaders spoke against the "revival" other than Clifford Hill and Derek Prince. Ironically, another was Benny Hinn who said (PTL telecast TBN, 4/7/97), that the animal sounds were purely demonic.

When Toronto and Brownsville died down, their spirit retreated into the Prophetic Movement which in the late 1990s and early 2000s became obsessed with gold dust, gemstones, feathers, oil, portals, third heaven visualisations, trances, spiritual drunkenness, orbs of light, drum circles and angel encounters.

But which power makes gold dust and angel feathers fall from the ceiling? manifests itself as clouds, orbs of light and perfumed smoke? makes people drunk, causes them to laugh hysterically, glues them to the floor for hours, and makes them act like animals? Is it the Spirit of God? Or is it another spirit?

Though many central figures in the Prophetic Movement originated in KCF, today there are many others. Some, like Bill Hamon and Todd Bentley, have become well known. Professing inspired prophecy, all propagate a blend of Reconstructionism/Dominion/ Kingdom Now Theology, Restorationism, Word of Faith teachings, and elements from the Shepherding movement in the 1970's and the Latter Rain movement of the 1950's.

They are convinced we are on the verge of a great end-time revival and last-days harvest and are seeing the restoration of the "five-fold" ministry, which will perfect the Church.

All today's prophets and apostles share the same beliefs: since the earth belongs to the Lord, we are to bring His kingdom rule out of heaven into every sphere of life. In short, to establish the Kingdom of God for Jesus. This is the doctrine of the Restoration movement, on websites and in magazines, newsletters and churches.

2004: Two Blows

At the end of 2004, the Prophetic Movement was shaken by 2 events:

1. Cain, a "father" of the movement, had become an alcoholic and a practising homosexual;
2. The public denunciation of the movement by Andrew Strom, formerly an genuine supporter.

The fall of Paul Cain

Cain's fall led to a public statement on Joyner's website released by himself, Jack Deere & Mike Bickle. In March 2005, Cain posted confession on his website acknowledging his fall and saying he had submitted to a team of leaders who were supervising every aspect of his restoration.

In April 2007, Cain resumed speaking in USA and abroad, though the three who publicly disciplined him earlier questioned his rehabilitation stating: "We cannot say with confidence that this is a genuine restoration." They had urged him to submit to a process of restoration after his confession, but when he refused their recommendations and was deemed "fully restored" by a somewhat unknown ministry whose processes they were not familiar with, they released their statement.

In May 2008, 78-year-old Cain stirred controversy when he appeared in Lakeland. He had a stroke shortly afterwards, but was reportedly stable and recovering.

Andrew Strom leaves the Prophetic Movement

Andrew Strom is an itinerant preacher from New Zealand. He has been part of the Charismatic movement for over 25 years and involved in the Prophetic Movement for 11, although he had voiced concern over some of the manifestations associated with Toronto and Brownsville. He is the founder of John the Baptist TV, RevivalSchool.com and the international email "Revival" List.

What Strom says is important. He is no closed-minded Fundamentalist, nor an old-order Pentecostal who rejects the new. He is an insider. He believes that the prophetic movement which begun in Kansas City in the early 1980s, was a good thing at its inception.

In October 2004, Strom attended the *Whitedove* prophetic conference in Kansas City. Many of the big names were there: Jones, Paul Keith Davis, Bobby Conner, John Paul Jackson, Jim Goll and others. Strom was heartbroken over what he saw. Afterwards he denounced the conference and the present condition of the whole movement. He said he was leaving and urged everyone to get out now before even worse was brought in.

Concerning the conference he wrote:

- Many parts were spiritually sick and more akin to a circus, e.g. on-stage dancing with a rather 'wild' aspect' and even one like a sensual 'Harem' dance.
- The worship had a very tribal feel at times, including dance items with just loud voodoo-style drums and frenzied leaping around making weird cries to the super-amplified beat. The feeling was oppressive and pagan. One of the main prophets said such dancing was originally God's type and they were 'stealing back' what the pagans had stolen from God!
- By the last session the audience threw away all inhibition and leapt into the pagan dancing with wild abandon. One of the main prophets even announced there were angels in the room "blowing on peoples' fingers" if only they would lift them up in the air!

As for the Prophetic Movement as a whole, he wrote:

- It had fallen since the early 1990's.
- It majored on 'manifestations', 'portals' and weird 'visitations'. People were encouraged to interact with 'Orbs of light' that came hovering down, to visualise their way into the '3rd Heaven'. It more closely resembled the New Age movement than anything Christian.
- A spirit of divination and fortune telling dominated the movement. It was sick beyond words and its prophets utterly blind.
- People were invited to pay for personal 'dream interpretations' and could book a half-hour personal appointment with a prophet for a hefty fee.
- There was almost no discernment. The deception was now so deep the movement was being given over by God to believe a lie, and would get much worse.
- It had become corrupt and spiritually defiled beyond all recovery.

Asked to name those he felt were a danger to the body of Christ, Strom, who did not normally name names, warned of Todd Bentley's teachings on 'How To Visit The Third Heaven' as nothing less than 'Guided Visualisation' from the New Age movement. He warned that attending such things, or allowing such men to 'guide' or lay hands upon you, will open you to all kinds of spirits and demonic counterfeits.

(For a fuller account of Strom's words, see Appendix 2.)

He has since issued two books warning of the dangers of the Prophetic Movement:

- **"True & False Revival"** (2008), in which he says It was difficult to find any big prophetic meetings without drunkenness, laughing, jerking, animal noises, gold dust, feathers and angel encounters.

The same Prophetic Movement that brought Orbs of light, angel visits, jewels and 3rd heaven experiences also birthed Todd Bentley and Lakeland. Bentley was at the forefront of most of the fads that spread through the Prophetic Movement before Lakeland. For example, in 2003 he

speaks of the appearance to him of an angel called Emma, with a white dress very like Kathryn Kuhlman, putting gold dust on people. He said Bob Jones had told him this was the angel that helped birth the whole prophetic movement in Kansas City in 1980. He also said that on a trip to the 3rd heaven he visited the small cabin where Paul lived, who told him that on his 3rd heaven visit Abraham had given him information to write Hebrews.

- **“Kundalini Warning- Are False Spirits Invading the Church?”** (2010). Strom warns of a vast array of apostate ministries that have virtually taken over entire sections of the Prophetic and Charismatic movements. He traces this mass invasion to 1994, the Toronto Blessing, culminating in the events surrounding Bentley and the 2008 Lakeland revival.

He has also circulated videos showing how this "invasion" started and the terrible impact on the church world-wide: <http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eBpw2oQrvMM>, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=dWeUNoR30_0

Strom gave further warnings in an article, ***What actually happened at Lakeland? KUNDALINI WARNING.*** He asked:

- what kind of "spirit" was at work when the leader was having an adulterous affair?
- In such an unholy environment, were the 'manifestations' from God? (i.e. violent "jerking", uncontrollable laughter, bodily contortions, drunkenness, 'portals', "angel" encounters, etc.)
- Why do we not see such in the Bible? Why did not Jesus or the apostles promote them?
- Why do we see them in the New Age and Hinduism? Many false religions have their own version of "laying on of hands" resulting in these very manifestations. This 'spirit' is not in the Bible, it is from Kundalini-type Hinduism!

He says that since 1993-4, a foreign spirit had invaded the Church, first through Rodney Howard-Browne, then Toronto, the Prophetic Movement, Lakeland and many others. Strom warned to "test the spirits" and not to let just anyone lay hands on you. This was a powerful spirit backed by many big-name ministries.

The Bible warns that the Last Days will be a time of "seducing spirits," false prophets, 'lying signs and wonders,' and that we need to watch for "angels of light" masquerading as the real thing.

He explicitly warned of the following ministries carrying or endorsing this Kundalini-type "anointing":

1. Todd Bentley
2. Rodney Howard Browne, the so-called "Holy Ghost Bartender"
3. Rick Joyner or anyone connected with MorningStar Ministries
4. John Arnott & any connected with Toronto Airport Christian Fellowship (The "Toronto Blessing")
5. Peter Wagner of the 'New Apostolic Reformation', head of a world-wide network of 'apostles' who publicly endorsed Lakeland
6. Mike Bickle and IHOP Kansas City. (Bickle promotes all this in his book)
7. Bob Jones, the Kansas City prophet whose ministry is utterly tainted by it all
8. Patricia King and anyone else from 'Extreme Prophetic'
9. John Crowder & anyone connected with "Sloshfest"
10. Bill Johnson of Bethel church, Redding, who publicly endorsed Lakeland and promotes the false anointing very strongly behind the scenes
11. Heidi & Rolland Baker of IRIS Ministries, who do good work amongst the poor in Mozambique, but have also carried and promoted this tainted anointing for years.
12. Randy Clark, Wes & Stacey Campbell, and other key figures from the "Toronto blessing."
13. The Elijah List - almost anyone featured on it has an 80+% chance of being 'off' in a major way.

(For a fuller explanation of the Kundalini spirit and examples of its effects, see Appendix 3.)

Some Features of the Prophetic Movement

Non-Traditional Methods

The following prophecy by Bill Yount (November 29, 2004), on one of the largest prophetic Internet sites, "The Elijah List", along with others just as absurd, was described as one of the most important words the Lord was speaking to the Church.

I heard the Father say: 'I am beginning to prophesy through commercials, candy and clothing—especially over the holidays!' I sense the Lord is going to begin to name some new candy bars. When these are named they will release a prophetic anointing every time the name of the candy is mentioned. These names will have power to call forth life and salvation. I am sure this prophetic candy is bound to have a heavenly taste to it that will be out of this world! People will end up tasting and seeing that the Lord is good! I saw angels anointing candy bar wrappers like God anointing prayer cloths of apostle Paul. Names on popular candy wrappers will speak prophetically to whomever reads or speaks their names. Candy wrappers will become like anointed prayer cloths throughout the land.

(For another example of this man's "prophecies", see my article on "The Passion of the Christ".)

Does this seem mouth-dropping? But not to fans of the Prophetic Movement! They say God is going to pour out His Spirit upon all flesh (saved and unsaved) in the last days. Traditional preaching is out. Power is in. The thing that will turn things around is a demonstration of supernatural power.

They are not only looking for power. They are seeking more and more innovative and non-traditional ways to release that power to effect the salvation of individuals and entire nations. One such innovation is evangelism by prophecy, when those with a prophetic gift or ministry go into the streets and prophesy over the unsaved.

Inspiring as such prophesying may seem in theory, consider the following example of what it means in practice. In freshfire.com in May 2003 Todd Bentley described how his team gave free psychic readings in Seoul, and called it Power Evangelism! He claimed 174 converts through these "God readings" telling them their destinies. He also wrote of a coming ministry in Las Vegas, with those trained in the prophetic in "dream interpretation booths"! (For more details, see Appendix 3 in the next chapter.)

The New Music

Joyner predicted a new kind of music, so anointed that people would fall under the power and be saved just by listening to it.

"Anointed music will be one of the church's biggest guns in the battle of the last days ... The Lord is about to anoint prophetic minstrels who will capture the world's attention..."

Joyner is not the only one to predict this. Around the same time James Ryle (Senior Pastor, Boulder, Colorado, Vineyard Church and mentor of Bill McCartney of Promise Keepers) predicted the same thing. In a 1990 article: "The Sons of Thunder - A Prophetic Dream", Ryle wrote of a couple of dreams regarding the new music God would unleash in these last days. It would be one of the most powerful tools for evangelism the Church will ever see. He said:

"... the Lord spoke to me and said, 'I'm about to release a new kind of song in the streets. It will bring a revelation of the truth and it will usher men into my presence.' I filed that away until about a month later, when I had another dream...In the second dream, I was taken to a large church which had a stage...When I awoke, the Lord said that there was going to be a new and distinctive anointing and sound restored to music that will turn the heads and capture the hearts of men for Jesus Christ. He said that we would see this happen when the church gets beyond the limits that she set for herself, into his grace, and takes the praise that is in the sanctuary and makes it music in the streets...Simply singing the truth in the name of Jesus Christ—'we say unto you be saved'—will release the power of His Spirit in such an awesome display that men and women will collapse in their seats converted to Christ...[the] key will be this new anointing He is about to give to his music."

What is wrong with this, you may say. Let us see what Ryle actually means by anointed music. In the same article he prophesied that the Beatles were at one time anointed by the Spirit to bring in revival through music!

"The Lord spoke to me and said, 'What you saw in the Beatles was from Me. ...And it was My purpose to bring forth through music that would usher in the move of My Spirit in bringing men and women to Christ... And I want to tell you those four lads, they aborted something... In 1970 (i.e. the year they broke up) I lifted the anointing off them...'"

Ryle goes on to say he saw a vision of the Beatles' 1967 Sergeant Pepper's Lonely Hearts Club Band record jacket,

"floating down, and he knew that represented the anointing, the mantle, the covering that was coming down on the 'Sons of Thunder'. And not long ago, the Lord said, 'I'm giving you permission to pass the jacket out.' "

How reliable are the new Prophets?

I John 4:1-3, says "believe not every spirit, but try the spirits whether they are of God: because many false prophets are gone out into the world." But a common theme of many of the new revelations is that those who resist the "new move of God" as unscriptural are lukewarm, immature or even divisive.

The following by Gwen Shaw, President of End-Time Handmaidens, is typical of this attitude:

"If you can't think in a new way, if you can't accept what I am going to do, you will burst. You will not be able to accept the expansion of this new wine. ... Because some are not equipped, and some are not prepared, and because of their indifference and their critical spirit, their wineskins shall burst."

"End-Time Handmaidens Magazine," June 1995, p 5

To censure testing of prophecy is wrong. The attitude of the noble Bereans in Acts 17 who, "searched the Scriptures daily, whether those things were so" is scarcely, if at all, encouraged. Rather, objections to the new revelations are deemed judgmental or a personal attack.

Sceptics are told: 'God is a lot bigger than doctrine', 'God offends our minds to reach our hearts' and, 'The Church is so hung up on Bible study, they don't know Jesus'. But He *is* the Word!

Since the new doctrines are founded on visions and prophecies, how accurate are they?

Bill Randles, an American Pentecostal pastor, researched their teaching and tapes, and exposed many false prophecies. In his book, "*Beware the New Prophets*", he shows how the new "prophets" try to elude responsibility for their messages, or Scriptural testing (e.g. Deut 13 and 18).

Acknowledgements of inaccurate prophecies

Inaccuracies are defended by the imperfections of Biblical prophets, even though such imperfections relate to their personal lives, not to their prophecies.

Futile attempts are made to justify errors from Acts 21:10-11, 33, claiming it was the Romans who bound Paul not the Jews. (But the Jews were the instigators! Just as the devil was behind some being cast into prison in Smyrna (Rev 2:10), even though it would have been human hands that did the actual work.)

Errors are justified on the basis that the speakers are learning to move in prophetic ministry. We cannot expect perfection until they have matured to being a manifested son of God! Here are some examples:

Hamon says, in "Prophets and Personal Prophecy",

"it is certainly possible for a true prophet to be inaccurate. ...we must understand the distinction between a false prophecy and a false prophet..."

Jack Deere, at Toronto Airport Vineyard in November 1994, referring to a bad example of erroneous "prophecy" said,

"God is in the process of offending our minds in order to reveal our hearts! And I don't know any place where He's going to give us a pure ministry. I don't know any place where it's going to be 100% right. There's going to be stumbling blocks in any ministry that the Holy Spirit is responsible for."

Rick Joyner gives an account of a message Bob Jones said the Lord gave him on prophetic accuracy:

"Bob (Jones) was told that **the general level of prophetic revelation in the church was about 65% accurate** at this time. **Some are only about 10% accurate**, a very few of the most mature prophets are approaching 85% to 95% accuracy. Prophecy is increasing in purity, but there is still a long way to go ... This [35-90% inaccuracy] **is actually grace for the church now**, because 100% accuracy in this ministry will bring a level of accountability to the church which she is too immature to bear at this time. It would result in too many 'Ananias and Sapphiras.' That **so many of the prophetic ministries are still missing so much** is also meant to work humility and wisdom in them so that they will be able to handle the authority and power coming in the near future."

"The Prophetic Ministry"

The Morning Star Prophetic Newsletter; Vol 3, No 2

How many of Isaiah's or Jeremiah's predictions failed? Did Hosea or Amos have a 35-90% failure rate while they matured? These statistics are no better than psychics! Who would fly on an airline whose planes crashed 35% of the time?! Why, then, should we submit to "baby" prophets who prophesy falsely 35-90% of the time?

In the same newsletter, Joyner wrote:

"One of the greatest hazards affecting maturing prophets is the erroneous interpretation of the OT exhortation that if a prophet ever predicted something which did not come to pass he was no longer to be considered a true prophet (Deut 18:20-22). The warning was that if this happened, the prophet had been presumptuous and the people were not to fear him. If one predicts something in the name of the Lord and it does not come to pass, he probably has spoken presumptuously and needs to be repented of, but that does not make him a false prophet. No one could step out in the faith required to walk in his calling if he knew that a single mistake would ruin him for life."

Although often calling them prophets, Bickle claimed that (apart from Cain) he did not consider the Kansas "prophets" yet to be prophets, only to have a prophetic ministry. (Yet they claim face to face encounters with God and give directive prophecies to individuals, congregations and the Church as a whole.) Bickle openly acknowledged that much professed prophecy is not prophecy at all:

*"Now, obviously, **probably about 80% of what's in the Body of Christ that's called prophecy is fleshiness**. And so we're in a day when we're in such an immature stage of this. So **much of what is called prophecy is not truly prophecy**.... We've been given 10,000 prophecies, and I believe there's only a small number that I've really cherished in my heart as from the Lord."*
"The Prophetic History of Grace Ministries"

In an interview with Bickle, in the tape, "The Shepherd's Rod", Jones said:

*"... what (the Lord) was really showing me was, 'I'm going to release the Rhema (i.e. the prophetic word) to where that many begin to move **two thirds right** on with their words, and the other third will be like poppin' a bullet at the enemy and He wouldn't fire. It was a blank.' ... 'If I release the 100% Rhema right now, the accountability would be so awesome and you'd have so much "Nannies" and Sapphiras going on the people couldn't grow'."*

In an interview with the Kansas City prophets, when Pytches asked if their prophecies were ever wrong, all agreed they had "occasionally" been proved wrong. Sometimes their revelation was right but their interpretation or application was wrong. In the foreword to Pytches' "Some Said It Thundered", Canadian revivalist John White writes:

*"Anyone who has experience in helping to nurture **baby prophets** realises **they have difficulty in distinguishing** the words that the Spirit speaks from those that come from their own hearts or from evil sources...Prophets are, of course, human beings. As such, they need not cease to be prophets for their mistakes and their failings."*

And these prophets are a crucial part of the divine government that Restorationists say is our foundation and to which we must submit in order to come to the full stature of Christ! A foundation of sand!

How can we trust such ministries, rely on their judgement, take anything they say seriously, or accept their "covering" when they themselves admit they can't tell the difference between the words of the Spirit and those from their own hearts or evil sources?

(For specific examples of inaccurate prophecies, see Appendix 1.)

APPENDIX 1

Examples of inaccurate prophecies

1. In 1993, in the MorningStar Prophetic Bulletin produced jointly with Joyner, Cain shared his dream of President Clinton: He saw the Lord put his Spirit on him, changing him into another man just as Saul.

"The Lord said that He was giving us a new president who is better than we deserve. He represents a reprieve from a New World Order that the Church is not prepared to face at this time..." ... Paul was told Clinton was better than we deserved and that he may be viewed as the best president in America since Eisenhower ... The Lord wants to use Bill Clinton to move the country forward and not backward." (Discernment newsletter Mar/Apr. 1993)

Yet this man made America a laughing stock!

2. Cain said ("Paul Cain's Ministry: Recent Manifestations of the Holy Spirit," Grace City Report, Special Edition, Fall, 1989), "Thus saith the Lord... everyone that's living under the immorality cover... will be brought down." According to Al Dager, when confronted with this, Cain said what he meant was that this would *begin* before the 1980s are out, not that it would be completed before then.
3. In 1989 and 1990, Cain prophesied that revival would break out in London in October 1990. He said, "the first shot (of revival) is going to be fired when John (Wimber) comes to England the next time." The Wimber Docklands meeting failed to meet expectations. Wimber eventually apologised for misunderstanding Cain's prophecy of "tokens" of revival as implying something much greater.
4. Gerald Coates, leader of one of the main UK Restorationist groups (now called Pioneer), strengthened his links with the US Prophetic Movement in the 1990s. In 1991 he visited N Zealand and told church leaders God had spoken to him strongly that an earthquake would devastate Lake Taupo in April 1991. Elim leaders believed it and appeared on TV to warn the nation. 44 Elim churches began taking survival courses. Nothing happened. The press had a field. When questioned, Coates said the faith and prayers of the leaders averted it. Why, then, did they take survival courses?
5. In Spring Harvest, April 1995, Coates prophesied to R T Kendall, "in 18 months ... your church, ... will be unrecognisable ... the Holy Spirit will increase in power ... not just upon Westminster Chapel but upon Westminster itself, upon the high of the land ... and many of your prayers – taxi drivers would get out of their taxis because the Spirit of God is so strong in that place – you're going to see them fulfilled." What happened? Over 100 left the Chapel after attempts to introduce the Toronto Blessing, and there was no sign of a Godly direction by "the high of the land".
6. In December 1998 some of the US leaders (Joyner, Jones and Jim Bakker) gave a series of "prophecies" about coming natural catastrophes. They predicted an earthquake in Southern California that would cause it to sink into the ocean, possibly after being blown up by terrorist nuclear bombs. Also, a good portion of the Midwest was to be submerged, the water almost covering the St. Louis Arch. They were to begin in 9 months. Joyner was so impressed he sent tapes out as part of his "Prophetic Tape of the Month Club".

None came true. In June 1999, in www.do-you-love-me.org/wsomers/laquake.html, ("LA Earthquake: Answers To FAQs"), Joyner attempted to explain:

Question: *When do we think that the California earthquake that we prophesied in our January 1998 Prophetic Tape of the Month is coming?*

Answer: *I do not know anyone who has the timing on this. Some misunderstood Bob Jones to say that it was coming in nine months (from New Year when the tape was made). When I listened to the tape again it was easy to understand how Bob's statement could be interpreted that way, but **it is not what he meant**. When he said "we have nine months" he was trying to say that **it would not come for nine months**. In a visitation that Bob had last fall he was told this quake **would not come before the next Day of Atonement**. He was also told each Day of Atonement we would be told if we have another year, but he would only show us **one year at a time**. I must apologise for letting this tape go out **without correcting** this potentially confusing statement."*

This is what was said on the original cassette:

*"Prophets stand in a window and see what will happen in the world. But now, the Lord has told Bob to step out of the window into it. The vision that he has received over many years **is not going to delay any longer**. He has got a message that **we have about nine months of preparation, of putting on Christ for what is about to happen**. I don't think we have until 2000. I think we've got about nine months. Some of these things, like Mammoth Lake, are going to happen before that. The trembling and things are going to happen. **Some of the major things aren't going to happen for nine months.**"*

So when Jones said we had 9 months, he meant nothing was going to happen for at least 9 months. And the not-for-nine-months statement could mean it wouldn't happen for years. But, Jones said, "we have about 9 months"—which implies that after 9 months things will begin to happen. And how can Joyner apologise for letting the tape go out uncorrected? How do you correct a Holy Spirit-inspired prophecy?

On the same tape Jones goes on to say:

"God will warn. He will warn those cities. I've been telling people for a year to get out of Los Angeles. They tell me that they're really brave out there. (sigh) I'm not that brave. Because that bravery is against God. If I lived in Los Angeles, I'd get out. I want to tell you something. The earthquake is not the only thing you got to worry about and I'm not sure it will be first. In a vision, I saw suitcases being smuggled in by terrorists into California. They had nuclear bombs in them."

After this tape had gone out, people started asking Joyner if they should get out of Southern California. His answer was:

*"Bob Jones has warned **some** people that it is time to leave Southern California. I have told people to **seek the Lord** and leave **only if He directs them to**. However, I have been told that the time is soon coming when I will have to begin telling people that **they should only stay if they hear from the Lord to stay**. I also personally feel that I am to invest in some kind of retreat property in Southern California. I have been told that I am not to abandon the area, and that I must be willing to spend time there doing what I can to **help the church** in that region."*

How confusing! Living in Los Angeles is "bravery against God." But you only need to leave if God "directs" you because Jones is only warning "some" to leave. In fact, God might direct you to "invest in some kind of retreat property" in Southern California and not abandon the area.

Question: *Do I believe that this quake can still be averted?*

Answer: *No. However, as I shared last New Years Eve, it is my conviction that the destructive power of this quake can be greatly reduced, by repentance and intercession. He also showed me that it can be be delayed if we will **honour the fathers and mothers of the faith from that region** which have so powerfully blessed our nation...If a profound repentance does not come, much of the Los Angeles basin will be destroyed to the point where the ocean will lap at the base of the mountains in Pasadena. The buildings in downtown Los Angeles will sink into the earth like stones in a jar of sand when it is shaken...
...Then Abraham asked the Lord if He would spare Sodom if there were just ten righteous men found there; the Lord said that He would spare the whole place just for them. We do not know at what point the Lord will relent and spare Los Angeles, but **there is a delusion in much of the church** now that is presuming on God's grace...Pride comes before the fall, and there is **an arrogance toward the Lord that has even permeated much of the church in Southern California**. One way that this is manifested is **the disregard of His warnings**, which He sent in the previous quake, and even the tendency to believe that they can handle them."*

So, if the "fathers and mothers of the faith" from the LA region are "honoured," it won't be hit as hard as it would be. But, the churches of the fathers and mothers of the faith in Southern California are delusional about God's grace, prideful, and display an arrogance towards the Lord manifested by their "disregard" for the warnings of Joyner, who is telling them that **maybe** "some" should get out of LA before he moves there to help them!

Very clear!

APPENDIX 2

Statements by Andrew Strom after his departure from the Prophetic Movement

Statements from his site <http://homepage.ihug.co.nz/~revival/index2.html> :

"It is with great sadness I make the following report. I said last week the 'Whitedove Conference' ... would be a pivotal one. It certainly was pivotal for me personally. I wish I could say that there was deep repentance - that the preaching was incredibly anointed and the crowd were on their faces crying before God ... but I can't. In fact, it seemed to me that the opposite was true...I was grieved to the core by it. Many parts of it I would even describe as spiritually 'sick'.

Some people believe that the fall of Paul Cain ... is some kind of aberration - just one individual's problem. But I am convinced... the fall of Paul Cain ... is a symptom of a much wider disease. The whole movement is sick. As I have stated in previous articles, the 'Prophetic' as we know it is really a 'fallen' movement - since the early 1990's. But I always held out hope that it would somehow turn around and get back on track again. In fact, I believed that this conference was a heaven-sent opportunity for that to happen.

However, after what I saw, I no longer believe this is possible. The deception is now too deep. This movement is being 'given over to believe a lie' and I want no part of it. I am cutting myself off, because I cannot afford the disease to spread into what we ourselves are doing. Things have now gotten so bad that we have to separate ourselves - and to do so publicly...

...This was a gathering of key prophets at a moment in time when the 'father' of the movement had just fallen. It was God's ideal moment for a truly 'solemn assembly'...However, what actually eventuated ... seemed to me to be more akin to a circus The music, concert-style lighting, stage dancers, groaning tables stacked high with books and CD's for sale, 'ear-tickling', the hype, \$40 door fee (plus extra offerings taken each session) - and that's just for starters.

What really bothered me ... was the total lack of any truly 'prophetic' preaching. There was some good stuff on self-pity and bitterness right near the start, but after that it was mostly downhill...Today's prophets seem to talk a lot about the 'sword of the Lord' but never actually bring it to bear. They bring no piercing word. And thus the entire movement is open to great deception. And instead of repentance, people are getting all kinds of counterfeit spiritual experiences. There seems to be almost no discernment at all.

The on-stage dancing ... was a good example. Now, I myself am a rock musician, but from the beginning these dance items had a rather 'wild' aspect that truly made me uncomfortable in my spirit. There was even one that came across like a sensual 'Harem' dance. Much of it really felt 'off' - and almost anyone who sees the videos will tell you so. Even the worship had a very 'tribal' feel to it at times. And by day 3 they were doing dance items with just loud voodoo-style drums only - and leaping around in a frenzied circle making weird cries to the super-amplified beat. The feeling in the room was so oppressive and 'pagan' that I could hardly even bear to stay in there.

Then came one of the most shocking statements of the conference - from one of the main prophets. He said people may feel uncomfortable with such obviously 'pagan' type dancing, but it was originally God's type and we were just 'stealing back' what the pagans had stolen from God!

I have to admit, this was the last straw for me. What could be more blatant? What kind of 'spirits' do they think are being transmitted to people who open themselves up to that music? There is no discernment in this movement at all...Remember, most of the major 'movers and shakers' of the Prophetic movement were at this conference, going along with this stuff. ... This movement demonstrates absolutely no discernment. I urge everyone to get out now, before even worse is brought in. I believe this movement is right now being given over to deception by God - and it is going to get much worse...

...By the last session the audience was so hyped they threw away all inhibition and leapt into the 'pagan' dancing themselves with wild abandon. And one of the main prophets even got up and announced there were angels in the room going around "blowing on peoples' fingers" if only they would lift them up in the air. That particular part sounds silly, but actually the whole thing by this

stage had become awful beyond words. Virtually every day I came home utterly grieved and depressed. I had come ... with great expectancy and hope, thinking that the return of Bob Jones may bring a renewal of all that was originally good about this movement. I literally came as a 'friend' and they turned me into an enemy in the space of three days.

Statements on <http://availablelightonline.com/blog> in What A Reaction, November 2004 archives:

"I have never seen such a 'shaking' caused by any article, ... I received over 2000 emails...It has not been the emails that disagree with me or accuse me of being 'divisive', etc, that bring me to tears. It is the emails.. that strongly agree with me and tell me of other horrors that they have witnessed themselves. I sat at my computer last night getting sadder and sadder as I read account after account of the sickness that has spread around the globe as part of this movement.

It is actually worse than I ever imagined. I know that Mr Taylor and others are hopeful that the Prophetic can somehow be 'reformed' ... But I tell you, I believe this movement is beyond reforming. It has reached the point of no return. Some slight changes may occur - but they can only be 'surface' ones really. That is why I felt I had to totally cut myself off at this time. It really has become that bad.

We are talking here about a movement where it is encouraged for people to interact with 'Orbs of light' that come hovering down..., or to pay money for personal 'dream interpretations'. ... that teaches people how to visualise their way into the '3rd Heaven' and sometimes holds 'Presbytery' days where you can book a half-hour personal appointment with a prophet for a hefty fee.

We are talking about a movement that majors on 'manifestations', 'portals' and weird 'visitations'. In every way it more closely resembles the New Age movement than anything Christian. In fact, more and more I am seeing that this movement is utterly dominated by a spirit of divination and fortune-telling. It is sick beyond words. And its prophets are utterly blind. Even now, they rush to hold a huge 'Visitations' gathering in Hollywood, led by Jill Austin - one of the most 'Divination'-oriented of them all.

I am close to tears even now, just writing about it. It is so awful what this movement has become. Please stay away from it, my friends. We are talking about demonic encounters here. 'And no marvel; for Satan himself is transformed into an angel of light. Therefore it is no great thing if his ministers also be transformed as the ministers of righteousness' (2 Cor 11:14-15).

When many asked Strom to publicly name those he felt were a danger to the body of Christ, he wrote:

"Now, I have come across Todd Bentley's teachings on 'How To Visit The Third Heaven' before, and I tell you, it is nothing less than 'Guided Visualisation' taken straight out of the New Age movement. Nothing less and nothing more. It is exactly the same. And I want you to know that if you attend these kinds of things, or allow these men to 'guide' you or lay hands upon you, then you are opening yourself up to all kinds of spirits and demonic counterfeits. As I have stated before, this movement has absolutely no discernment at all. It has sunk into such deception that its leaders are opening people up to all kinds of demonic experiences on a daily basis. It has no idea that it is even doing it. It behaves exactly like a movement that has been 'given over to deception' by God...

...It is with great sadness that I make the above points. I have refrained from saying such things in the past, but I can no longer do so, because untold people are being spiritually damaged by what is going on. Please understand my heart in this.

For the same reason I also need to warn you about another 'prophetess' often featured on the Elijah List. Her name is Jill Austin and I have personally witnessed her ministry. I would describe it as one of the most disturbing (by far) meetings that I have ever been in. There was definitely a strange 'power' operating, but it certainly did not seem like God to me. She is also an expert at 'hyping' an audience. Please be very careful in such environments, my friends. You can end up taking part in things that you would never normally do, just because you are part of a large crowd.

Sadly, there seems to be many other ministries in this movement involved in a similar deception. In fact, I hate to say it, but a general rule might be that if someone is featured on the Elijah List, there has to be at least an 80% chance that their ministry is 'off' in some major way.

APPENDIX 3

What is Kundalini? (Adapted from Andrew Strom)

How do we explain the bodily distortions and jerking associated with Toronto? Does God distort bodies to look like epileptics? Repetitive jerking is also seen regularly in mental hospitals.

According to Strom, alarmingly, there are many exact similarities between 'Toronto' manifestations and those in the New Age movement and many pagan religions.

Several Indian gurus fell into trances and states of rapturous bliss, often accompanied by uncontrollable laughter or weeping, visions and astral projections. These states could be transferred with a single touch.

Examples include Ramakrishna, Bagwhan Shree Rajneesh (often said to be "drunk on the divine", whose followers often fell to the floor in ecstasy), and Swami Baba Muktananda. According to a former devotee, the latter was able simply by shaktipat (touch) to trigger the awakening of the kundalini with resulting manifestations, including uncontrollable laughing, roaring, barking, hissing, crying, shaking, etc. Some also became mute or unconscious, while many felt infused with feelings of great joy, peace and love.

What is Kundalini?

It is a Hindu, Eastern mystical cult term typically described as a powerful energy source lying dormant in the form of a coiled serpent at the base of the spine. Many in New Age and Eastern religions experience a powerful awakening of that energy, often through the touch of a guru or spiritual teacher. The release of the energy is often followed by Shakti manifestations, such as strange and involuntary bodily movements, unmotivated and unnatural laughter or crying, tongues and imitation of animal sounds.

Researcher Robert Walker wrote in 1995:

(At meetings held by mystic Hindu gurus) devotees go forward to receive spiritual experience from a touch by the open palm of the hand, often to the forehead, by the guru in what is known as the Shakti Pat or divine touch. The raising of the spiritual experience is called raising Kundalini. After ... the devotee has reached a certain spiritual elevation they begin to shake, jerk, or hop or squirm uncontrollably, sometimes breaking into uncontrolled animal noises or laughter as they reach an ecstatic high. These manifestations are called 'Kriyas'. Devotees sometimes roar like lions and show all kinds of physical signs ... Often devotees move on to higher states of spiritual consciousness and become inert physically and appear to slip into an unconsciousness...

The guru Shri Yogānandji Mahārāja wrote:

"When your body begins trembling, hair stands on roots, you laugh or begin to weep without your wishing, your tongue begins to utter deformed sounds, you are filled with fear or see frightening visions, the Kundalini Shakti has become active."

'Qigong' is a popular Chinese Kundalini-type movement. When a Qigong spiritual master spoke in 1991 in the USA, the San Francisco Chronicle reported many began to experience "spontaneous movements", and "before long the scene began to resemble a pentecostal prayer meeting, with many people waving their arms and making unintelligible sounds". The master said,

"Those who are sensitive might start having some strong physical sensations, or start laughing or crying. Don't worry. This is quite normal."

Likewise, the demonic "ministry" of renowned 18th C occultic healer Mesmer was also known to produce similar manifestations (falling down, jerking, convulsions, strange grunts & cries, hysterical laughter, etc).

Why do the effects and manifestations of the Impartation-type meetings that have flooded so many churches since Rodney Howard-Browne and Toronto in 1994 so resemble the "Kriyas" manifestations and the Kundalini awakening? And the occult Chinese Qigong, and Mesmer's occult healing practices?

Is it because the same spirits are at work? A powerful alien spirit?

They have no Biblical parallel. Just because the Toronto manifestations have been described in Christian terminology does not mean they are from God.

Such manifestations are not in the Bible.

But they are found throughout the New Age movement.

Many involved with Toronto have assumed it "must be of God" as it often results in 'inner healing' or other spiritual experiences. But this is not proof it is of God. There are virtually identical experiences in occult and New Age groups. "Inner healing" is a major emphasis of the New Age movement.

Video links showing "kriyas" and other Kundalini-type manifestations in the Lakeland "revival":

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=QyW1UFzS2LY>
<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=eaNiuRWHZrY>
http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=BCcGaTRwG_4

Examples of the effects of the Kundalini spirit

"D": I went to **Lakeland** 3 times. ... I really thought it was of God... I had so many supernatural experiences - to seeing a mystical Jesus with a third eye, angels talking to me, visions, being transported. I had one experience with my daughter being in the room and her experiencing it too. I was roaring like a lion, had gold dust and many other experiences. The worst thing that happened is that it got sexual. This false Jesus was approaching me sexually and I fell into it. I still to this day do not understand how I could have been so deceived. I have been a Christian since the age of 16. I am 49 now... I fell right in... hook, line and sinker. When I came home that last visit I became aware it was demonic, and I was surrounded and covered with demons literally, it was so horrible, all that I went through, you cannot imagine... I was seeing demons and being touched sexually and tormentingly constantly... it has been 1 1/2 years and I am still battling these demonic spirits. I cry out to the Lord everyday for total deliverance. It has been horrible. I have renounced and repented, but still fighting. How do we get free of this?

SHERIE: I was infested with this foul eastern spirit, the kundalini. I was in a movement from 1992 - 2000 which had close links with **Toronto**. From 2000 - 2006 I joined a church with links to **Bill Johnson**. I was desperate for God to move in my life and change situations and heal hurts and was very open to ministry - I had many in this movement touch my forehead and experienced the manifestations you describe - drunkenness, laughing and crying, shaking. I got dreams and visions and just before I left the structure (church) I had a vivid dream of a huge python that came through the back door and attached itself to my car, and also to rooms in my home. I was very disturbed and sought the Lord for an answer.

It took about 6 months before I was delivered, but God brought a couple over my path who God had trained and had victory over spiritual entities. Every time I was in their presence, I would get very anxious, and they would calmly pray for me and I could feel darkness leaving and my sanity restored. It was only after 6 months of these episodes, I was again in their presence and sensed a fight ensue in the Spirit. I was very anxious and fearful and could feel a huge snake in my spine - I was rigid and very uncomfortable - It felt as if this thing wanted to throttle me and rob me of my life. I called out to God and they quietly prayed - then I asked the lady to pull this serpent out of my head - it felt as if it could exit near the top of my crown. She continued to pray and I got the word "kundalini" in my spirit and just commanded this thing by its name to go in the mighty name of Jesus Christ. I pled the blood as it was very frightening, and it left. I felt like a washed out rag, but I was free!

... Afterwards they were amazed and asked me what strange term I had used and where it came from - I had no idea except that it was God who gave me knowledge in that situation. Thank you for the info that has made everything clear to me! I now have confirmation from where I was infected!

LUCY: David Wilkerson also mentioned the kundalini spirit, and I researched, after having attended the Fredericksburg (Virginia) Prayer Furnace at which **Che Ahn** ministered. There, I saw many of the manifestations you mention: hopping and jumping during "worship", falling backward at Che Ahn's touch, extreme jerkiness in several cases. Very uncomfortable with this, I came home and watched (my first time ever) videos of Todd Bentley. Needless to say, I was appalled...

ANDREW STROM: if you have had "hands laid" or done "soaking prayer" under any of these kinds of ministries, it is very important to RENOUNCE (from the very depths of your being in Jesus' name) and also COMMAND OUT these 'kundalini' spirits or any other "anointing" you have received. Remember, you must VIOLENTLY EXPEL these things in the name of JESUS. Be FREE in His mighty name!

The 1990s

THE RESTORATION OF APOSTLES & THE NEW APOSTOLIC RESTORATION

As described in the previous chapter, the 1980s saw the rise of the prophetic movement. In the 1990s these prophets began ordaining apostles.

This was the final phase of the Restorationist vision of a government based on a restored Five-Fold Ministry of Ephesians 4:11, for the equipping of the saints, for the work of the ministry, for the building up of the body of Christ. Particular emphasis was put on the restoration of the offices of apostle and prophet, absent for almost 2000 years.

Apostles soon disappeared from the post Biblical early Church. They were replaced by the bishop-centred Nicolaitan hierarchical pyramid structure. (For fuller details, see my "The Ephesus & Smyrna Church Ages" booklet.) It came (wrongly) to be taught that the ministry of apostles was limited to the foundation period of the Church.

For many centuries the office of an apostle was virtually unheard of.

From the 19th C, however, it began to be spoken of again. At first this was only among those on the fringes of evangelical Christianity:

- the Catholic Apostolic Church, associated with the ministry of Edward Irving;
- Alexander Dowie's Zion Church;
- the UK pentecostal Apostolic Church (HQ Penygroes); and
- the post war Latter Rain movement (although they were unwilling to publicly acknowledge those considered to be so gifted).

More recently, however, the concept has moved towards centre stage in thought and practice among mainstream Christians. The two key influences were:

- the 1970s UK Restorationist movement; and
- the 1990s USA New Apostolic Reformation (NAR)

Ultimately, however, whether they knew it or not, both were laying a foundation for a coming Protestant Magisterium. The age-old Nicolaitan spirit was still alive and well!

("Magisterium" is a Catholic term. It refers to the Church's collective authority residing in its bishops, councils and ultimately the Pope. It has authority to formulate doctrine. Since most of this is considered infallible, the Magisterium's teaching is, in effect, the Bible for the average Catholic. If Scripture contradicts the Magisterium, Scripture is set aside. The Church is the highest authority.)

The UK Restorationist Movement

After the Latter Rain, a key post war figure who stressed the need to recover the ministry of the apostle was Arthur Wallis in the UK. In 1972, a group gathered, including he and Bryn Jones. As the group developed, out of it emerged some of the chief UK House/Restoration churches.

UK Restorationists made early contact with the Fort Lauderdale Five (and particularly Ern Baxter), the originators of the Shepherding Movement in the USA.

The Shepherding Movement

In 1974, Bob Mumford, Charles Simpson, Derek Prince and Don Basham formed Christian Growth Ministries. Its aim was to counter perceived excesses within the Charismatic movement by emphasizing the authority of shepherds over their sheep.

When joined by Baxter, the group became known as the Fort Lauderdale Five, and their ministry as the Shepherding Movement.

This doctrine attained its greatest impetus in the mid-1970s. It stressed effective discipleship and complete submission to the shepherd/elder. As in other hierarchies, there was a pyramid government in which each submits to the next higher. Individual believers were at the bottom, then house group leaders, then elders, then the chief shepherds. Total discipline was imposed, even over family life. Failure to obey could lead to disapproval, condemnation, and ultimately disfellowshipping.

Its origin lay in the teachings of Watchman Nee and Juan Carlos Ortiz.

Ortiz pioneered the concept of "covering" or "shepherding". In his book, "Discipleship", he wrote of the need to "control your disciples", describing a disciple as "one who obeys commands".

Nee, in his book "The Body of Christ", taught total submission to God's ordained authority in the church. He even suggested that those unwilling to submit would be separated from Christ. In another book, "Spiritual Authority", he wrote:

"If God dares to entrust his authority to men, then we can dare to obey. Whether the one in authority is right or wrong does not concern us since he has to be responsible directly to God. The obedient needs only to obey; the Lord will not hold us responsible for mistaken obedience, rather He will hold the delegated authority responsible... Insubordination, however, is rebellion, and for this the one under authority must answer to God."

Such blatantly Nicolaitan, Romish teaching was taken up both in USA and UK:

- Baxter drew heavily on Nee and spoke of God restoring spiritual authority, raising up men with delegated authority.
- Prince stated, "We do not obey those in authority because they are right, we obey them because they are in authority."

According to Dager in Media Spotlight, the Five joined with Ralph Martin and Steve Clark of the Catholic charismatic Word of God communities to form "The Council", to infiltrate churches with the shepherding doctrine.

By the late 1970s this Movement caused a deep split among US charismatics because of the strict control many exercised, threatening to tear the American renewal in two.

By the mid-1980s, after the great controversy surrounding submission teaching and the bad reputation earned by its abuses, the term "shepherding" was dropped. The Fort Lauderdale Five parted company, issuing statements disassociating themselves from the effects of this teaching.

But the idea lived on under alternative labels such as "mentoring", "covering", "networking" and "covenant relationships." (The idea of covenant relationships originated with the Fort Lauderdale group, who pledged themselves to support one another.)

Wallis and Jones were much influenced by Baxter, especially in 1975 and 1976.

Soon, however, instead of shepherds, the UK leaders began to speak of apostles.

Where the idea of recovering the ministry of apostles originated is uncertain. Andrew Walker, an authority on the origins of the UK Restoration movement, speculated on the influence of the UK Apostolic Church. (Bryn Jones had been a leader in the Aberdare Apostolic Church.)

Whether called shepherds or apostles, however, in practice the two were much alike. Several UK leaders continued the Fort Lauderdale link and, especially in the earlier years, the UK apostolic concept owed much to Fort Lauderdale with its authoritarian views on leadership and submission.

A significant relaxation of control in UK Restorationist churches occurred in the 1980s, perhaps linked with developments at that time in Fort Lauderdale.

The New Charismatic Magisterium

But the demise of the Shepherding Movement, and its early attempts to bring order and organisation to the very many independent charismatic groups that had arisen since the 1960s, did not deflect the Nicolaitan spirit from its goal in the pentecostal/charismatic scene.

The quest would continue for a universal, world-wide Protestant eldership/Magisterium to mirror the Catholic one. But this was not the ultimate goal...

- The Nicolaitan spirit had already submitted the Catholic charismatic renewal to the Magisterium.
- The ultimate goal of the submitted Catholic renewal was union with Protestant charismatics.
- To achieve this, Protestants would be encouraged to submit to authority and to form a world Protestant charismatic leadership of chief brethren.
- And guess who the head of such a united catholic/Protestant charismatic union would be?!

Let us trace some of the stepping stones to the formation of a universal world-wide Protestant eldership/Magisterium.

Clayt Sonmore describes a convention in 1980 in which David du Plessis spoke of the desperate need for a universal and pyramidal submission to ministerial authority at local, national and international levels, culminating in a universal eldership of chief brethren, an apostolic council of world leadership.

Thankfully, that appeal was fatefully undermined by an address by Sonmore himself and the idea of a Protestant image of the Roman Magisterium was not pursued, on that occasion.

In 1997, the case for a Protestant Magisterium was again advocated. This time it was by Bill Hamon, recognised by most restorationists as the "father" of the prophetic movement. In his book "Apostles, Prophets and the Coming Moves of God", he gives his vision for the coming apostolic government:

*"I personally believe that in the 1990's and into the 21st C, **as prophets and apostles are being restored back to proper order and function within the Church, many of these church councils of leading present-truth ministers will be necessary. One particular apostle or prophet or camp will never receive the whole revelation for the establishing of prophets and apostles back into the Church. Many will have visions (even of Jesus), dreams, rhemas, angelic visitations and supernatural personal experiences and sovereign moves of the Holy Spirit in their meetings. But doctrines that claim to be binding on all Christians must not be established by only one apostle, prophet, or camp. There must be meetings of a Church council with other leaders of past and present restorational streams of truth.**"*

So, we need a *Charismatic* Magisterium authorised to decide all matters of faith and practice, and to formulate doctrines **binding** on all Christians. These will be based on various supernatural experiences, but with no mention of Scripture. This coming government must not be established by the experiences of any one individual, but be approved by the others. (i.e. individuals can be deceived but not the collective ministry. Yet what of Ahab's 400 "prophets of the Lord"?)

He continues:

*"When **the five-fold ministers come together to consider doctrines and practices this way, they will need to keep several areas of insight in mind:***

- (1) The claimed revelation from God;*
- (2) The fruit of the ministry among those who have received the doctrine or practice;*
- (3) The supernatural working of God accompanying it;*
- (4) The **logos** [written] and rhema word of God application and authority for the doctrine or practice; and*
- (5) The witness of the Spirit and the **unified consent of those present.**"*

At least he now mentions Scripture! "To the law & to the testimony!" (Isa 8:20)

Restoration of Apostles in the USA: The New Apostolic Reformation

Soon the universal world-wide Protestant eldership/Magisterium was to take concrete form, mushrooming dramatically in the USA and elsewhere.

The catalyst was the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR) with its concept of restored apostles and apostolic government.

The key figure in the NAR authority structure is Presiding Apostle C Peter Wagner. He streamlined the ideology and named it. This new reformation is implementing his teaching.

According to Wagner, in his foreword to the 2001 edition of Ted Haggard's book, *The Life Giving Church*,

"The NAR is an extraordinary work of God that began at the close of the 20th C and continues on. It is, to a significant extent, changing the shape of the Protestant world."

In his book "The Great Transfer of Wealth, Are You Ready?", Wagner announced the NAR begun in 2001:

"The biblical government of the church has been coming into place with the recognition of the gift and office of prophet in the 1980's and the gift and office of apostle in the 1990s. I believe that the Second Apostolic Age actually began in 2001"

So, Wagner sees the new prophets and apostles as fundamental to the government of God's end time Kingdom, the new one world global Church.

These apostles and prophets view their postdenominational NAR movement as the future face of Protestantism and the end of denominations as we know them. The NAR seeks to reform the Church globally. Local churches are networked to other apostolic churches relating to one another, with leaders in authority over each region and nation. Everyone, from individual believers to top leaders, is accountable to someone.

In effect, a large block of the evangelical world is being reorganised into a hierarchy resembling that of Roman Catholic Church.

The Nature of New Apostolic Reformation Apostles

What exactly does the NAR mean by an apostle?

Not missionaries who go into unreached areas to plant churches, but **governmental, ruling** apostles claiming power from on high with signs and wonders.

In "The Harvest", p 33, Rick Joyner claims:

"Miracles which exceed even some of the most spectacular biblical marvels will cause whole nations to acknowledge Jesus ... The appearances of angels will be so common that they will cease to be related as significant events. The Lord Himself will appear to councils of apostles and elders, and give them directives".

Yet by building a massive Global Church, these apostles are establishing a system that will usurp the Headship of Jesus, not holding Him in His rightful position, although saying things that appear to do so.

And they insist that submission and obedience to the new apostles is mandatory.

Cronquist plainly reveals the extent of the obedience they demand in the following:

"The greatest decision that the church is going to have to make in these days ahead...is to face that there are apostles of God, that they must submit to that authority and to that office. They must submit to that foundation as though it was Jesus Christ, and whosoever will not submit to that authority shall be destroyed from among the people".
"Your Daily Cross Is Giving Up The Throne Of Self"

It is claimed the full emergence of, and submission to, the new apostles will resolve disagreement over the extent of authority in the new government. (E.g., in "The Five-Fold Ministry Debate", Bill Burns says disunity over roles is a real problem. Many pastors are afraid of the new government since some are telling them they "really aren't supposed to be leading the flock". Most "don't know what to do".)

According to John Eckhardt, one of Wagner's leaders, in his book, "Moving in the Apostolic":

"The war between the Pastor and the Prophet will cease with the full emergence of the Apostle... Are we going to be willing to submit our ministry to a specific Apostolic visionary? This is a critical question that will determine our influence on hastening the coming of the Lord, in our effective contribution to the restoring of all things spoken by the prophets"

The Progress of the New Apostolic Reformation

Wagner has initiated his own group of leaders and apostolic churches across all denominational boundaries. He is presiding apostle of the International Coalition of Apostles, with several hundred apostles in USA and about 40 nations.

Although the acknowledged leader of the NAR, there are now also many other professed apostles and apostolic networks outside his group of apostles.

And with Dutch Sheets, Cindy Jacobs, Mike Bickle, Tommy Tenney and many others promoting Wagner's new 21st C Church model, apostolic networks have the ear of the Church. NAR ideology and "relational networks" have taken deep root.

According to world missions statisticians, Apostolic churches, often from Pentecostal and Charismatic backgrounds, are now the fastest-growing segment of Christianity world-wide. Some even say it is the largest single block of Protestant Christianity on the globe. It is often overlooked as it does not comprise a single denomination.

In "New Apostolic Reformation and the Faith and Work Movement", John Rowell states:

*"David Barrett, editor of the World Christian Encyclopaedia reports **1,000 apostolic networks** ... in his global database ... **on six continents** and account, by his estimate, for some 100 million believers world-wide. Dr. Wagner estimates that in the US alone there are as many NAR churches as Southern Baptist congregations – something approaching 40,000. Growth in the Third World ... far surpasses the more mundane statistics in the West. Europe's largest church is Manna in Lisbon, with 25,000 members. The Universal Church of the Kingdom of God in Brazil claims over 3m congregants. The world's largest are now in Nigeria where the Church of Jesus Christ in Lagos assembled 10-12m people for its Holy Spirit service in December 2000. The world has never seen this kind of church expansion!"*

And they mean business!

In a DVD of an apostolic conference, "2008, Starting the Year off Right", Dutch Sheets reveals NAR plans to take over. He showed a dotted map of the USA with hundreds of large and smaller dots spaced evenly across the country. The larger dots showed the apostolic hubs: the teaching and training centres already in place. The smaller dots showed the individual apostles in place. Underneath the apostles would be the individual churches that would be a local expression of the global Church. The NAR believes we are no longer to think in terms of our local church but of the Kingdom (i.e. the coming one world Church).

C Peter Wagner (1930-)

Exalted to "Apostle of the World" by his fellow apostles and prophets, Wagner calls himself a "super apostle" and the "apostle" of many organisations in his NAR. These include Global Harvest Ministries, World Prayer Centre, Apostolic Council of Prophetic Elders, International Coalition of Apostles, New Apostolic Roundtable, Wagner Leadership Institute and Wagner Publications.

Let us look more fully at Wagner and his work.

From 1956-1971 the Wagners were missionaries in Bolivia. In 1971 Wagner became a professor of Church Growth at the Fuller Theological Seminary School of World Mission where he taught until 1998 promoting explosive mega-church growth. With Donald McGavran, Wagner established the popularity and influence of this school among Evangelicals, Pentecostals and Charismatics internationally. He mainstreamed the concept of cell church structures, a strategy initiated in Asia and S America resulting in congregations of tens of thousands.

(Cell churches are organised like a pyramid, with small groups, usually no more than 12, tasked with spinning off new groups and growing the church. Each group has a leader with lower level leaders accountable to their superiors, on up the chain. Such "accountability" used to be called shepherding, but because of reports of coercive and abusive practices, it has been rebranded "discipling." Lay people in cell groups perform many functions normally carried out by pastors, and pastors become like corporate chief executives. This is how many of today's megachurches function.)

In his church growth role, Wagner repackaged radical shepherding and cell structures as mainstream concepts for church growth. Democracy does not feature in these strategies, as seen in Wagner's 1999 book *Churchquake: How the New Apostolic Reformation is Shaking up the Church as We Know It*. Describing a radical re-structuring of local church government, he writes: "The traditional concept is that the congregation owns the church and hire the pastor to do their ministry for them. New apostolic churches...turn this around 180 degrees..."

In 1982 Wagner, with John Wimber, founder of the Vineyard Movement, created a new course at Fuller, "Signs, Wonders and Church Growth". Since then, Wagner has been associated with Charismatic teaching and theology. He describes himself as a Charismatic Evangelical, coining the term, "the Third Wave" (i.e. distinct from the first two waves, Pentecostals and Charismatics).

In 1998 Wagner retired from Fuller to focus on his own areas of ministry. This new ministry is at the heart of the New Apostolic Reformation (NAR):

- **Global Harvest Ministries** was founded to help evangelism and Church planting around the world. It is C Peter and Doris Wagner's personal para-church ministry and legal parent of many of the other of his NAR organisations. A 1998 Global Harvest conference entitled: "New Apostolic Reformation: A Springboard Into The 21st C" boasted that Wagner's NAR was "changing the shape" of Protestant Christianity.

"... be prepared to think 'outside the box.' New moves of God are always controversial. Dr. Wagner will examine what he believes is the next major move of God around the world. Join us as Dr. Wagner explains how the NAR is, to a significant extent, changing the shape of Protestant Christianity. In virtually every region of the world, these new apostolic churches constitute the fastest growing segment of Christianity".

- In 1998 he also co-founded the early HQ and initial nerve centre of the movement, the 55,000 sq ft, \$5.5m **World Prayer Centre** in the same building, in association with Ted Haggard, pastor of the New Life Church (Colorado Springs). It used the Internet to co-ordinate global prayer ministry.

The World Prayer Centre (WPC)

An estimated 50m people in 120 lands are involved with the WPC. It emails information to Christians (and also *collects* information *about* Christians) throughout the world. It is linked to many other national prayer networks, each in constant computer contact with the WPC. Participating networks report to the National Prayer Network, and the National Prayer Network to the WPC, which reports to Wagner, the main co-ordinator of all its activities.

No one is more central to the globalisation of the Church than Wagner. The WPC website explains how it is tracking thousands of ministries and churches:

"We see our task as getting people in touch with one another to form interactive, human web networks properly equipped to wage effective spiritual warfare. The WPC is a fully equipped nerve centre with data and information about prayer needs throughout the world [which] ... networks prayer ministries, denominations, churches and cell groups".

Why this global network? To pave the way for the NAR in which restored apostles establish worldwide networks to usher in the emerging New Order Church they call the kingdom of God.

They believe they, like the apostles who established the early Church, are called to lay the foundation for the new Kingdom and global (one world) Church. Their goal is total authority over the Church. Claiming to hear directly from God, they claim authority and expect obedience and submission in all things. They believe the world is awaiting a take over by a militant Church (Joel's Army) that will arise, govern and dominate the world politically and spiritually.

This is a highly organised group with a global agenda.

As Sandy Simpson says in the "deceptioninthechurch" website in "The Agenda & Teaching of the NAR":

"This agenda (the apostolic and prophetic reformation) runs through thousands of agencies and web sites. It is what is driving the Transformations movement, the global prayer movement, and thousands of other churches and organisations. ... A majority of Christian churches have already succumbed to this Dominionist agenda ... Wagner is talking about the government of the church, under the leadership of the new foundational restored "apostles", OVERTHROWING the governments of the world. A spirit is indeed saying something to the churches, but ... this is not ... the Holy Spirit speaking. If this agenda that C. Peter Wagner is proposing, and is about to pull off, is not "the woman who rides the beast" I don't know what is!"

The WPC is a Protestant Vatican City. Many thousands of ministries, organisations and fellowships are networking to better carry out their plans for unity and world evangelisation. They are forming major new allegiances and holding prophetic conferences in every major nation to formulate the doctrines and bureaucracy of the new "apostolic government".

These people are deadly serious about becoming God's government on earth.

The WPC claims to promote strategic and effective prayer. But it isn't really about prayer. It's about networking everyone into a massive computer database. Most organisations are linked to the WPC in some way. Everybody who's anybody attends the special meetings. Just one of the many organisations that meets there is the National School of the Prophets. Guest speakers have included: Chuck Pierce, Cindy Jacobs, Bill Hamon, Dutch Sheets, Rick Joyner, Kingsley Fletcher, Mike Bickle, Jim Lafoon, Barbara Wentroble, Ted Haggard, Paul Cain, Jack Deere and Barbara Yoder.

The WPC is run like a giant network marketing company. Network marketing and computerisation provide the means to control Wagner's sprawling third wave organisations. Prayer for world evangelisation is the vehicle to rally Christians and Christian organisations into his network.

The WPC is very complex. All power and control flows to the top in a way that would almost make the Pope envious. As it grows it collects more and more sub-organisations, each with its own restored apostles and prophets and brand of revival doctrine. The ultimate aim is to network all existing churches and church organisations under the umbrella of the WPC.

Apostolic Council of Prophetic Elders (ACPE)

The WPC is just one of many groups Wagner formed to promote his concept of spiritual warfare (seeking out and binding territorial spirits).

The most important is the ACPE, an inner circle of two to three dozen apostles with a recognised prophetic gift, which professes to be an internationally recognised authority on prayer and spiritual warfare.

As an indication of membership, the January 2002 Council meeting was attended by Wesley and Stacey Campbell, Jim Goll, Bill and Evelyn Hamon, Mike and Cindy Jacobs, Jim Lafoon, Bart Pierce, Chuck Pierce, Rick Ridings, John and Paula Sandford, Michael and Andrea Schiffmann, Gwen Shaw, Dutch Sheets, Sharon Stone, Tommy Tenney, Hector Torres, Peter and Doris Wagner and Barbara Wentroble.

Current members include Steve Schultz, Mary Glazier (who claims 2008 US Vice Presidential candidate Sarah Palin as part of her spiritual warfare network) and Lou Engle.

In November 1999, Wagner, then fast becoming head of the whole prophetic/apostolic movement, convened a meeting of this Council to discuss a timetable for putting the apostolic government into place. Part of a synopsis by Chuck Pierce in his January 2000 newsletter is given below.

"God is going to shake governments. Rulers will bow their knee to the Lord of Glory and dedicate their nations to the Lord Jesus Christ. The government of God's Kingdom will be established through the apostles and prophets laying the foundation for the church. We will begin to recognise the apostolic and prophetic authorities in cities and nations... The church will be in a key transition period between 2000 and 2003 ... the youth in particular will be transitioning into revival. It is especially important for the apostolic governments to be initially established and functioning in our cities by October 2003 if we are to see the transformations that God wants to release".

A statement after the February 2000 meeting said every city must have apostolic leadership over it. Wagner's book, "Apostles of the City: How to mobilise the territorial Apostles for city Transformation", says apostles and prophets must be incorporated into the Church and work with the pastors for success in their communities and cities.

(To more fully understand the ideology and methodology of the NAR, it is necessary to look more closely at two of the aspects alluded to in this section:

- *the NAR concept of spiritual warfare, and*
- *the NAR significance of the term Transformation.*

Further detail is provided in the two boxes following the next section.)

International Coalition of Apostles & New Apostolic Roundtable

Wagner is also the "presiding apostle" of the International Coalition of Apostles (ICA), formed in 2000, and "convening apostle" of the New Apostolic Roundtable.

The ICA's definition of apostle is: "An apostle is a Christian leader gifted, taught, commissioned, and sent by God with the authority to establish the foundational government of the Church within an assigned sphere of ministry by hearing what the Spirit is saying to the churches and by setting things in order accordingly for the growth and maturity of the Church."

The ICA is the Wagner network of several hundred apostles in the US and about 40 other nations, each with ministries under them, some hundreds or even thousands. ICA seeks to bring apostles together, by invitation only, to facilitate mutual acquaintance and communication. The goal is 500 -1000 members.

It was said to be 532 at the time of the 2008 Lakeland fiasco. (See Appendix 1 for some of the most prominent names.)

(Many significant NAR leaders have their own networks and are not ICA apostles, e.g. Rick Joyner of MorningStar Ministries, and Mike Bickle, head of IHOP (International House of Prayer) and model for global 24/7 and "Harp and Bowl" prayer movements. Bickle has served in the ACPE.)

The New Apostolic Roundtable is a smaller unit. Membership is by personal invitation. Chuck Pierce is the prophetic counsel. This group is not to exceed 25. (According to the principles of group dynamics, a meaningful accountability unit based on personal relationships must not exceed 25.) Wagner hopes the ICA will spawn a significant number of smaller accountability groups.

Members include: Che Ahn, Bob Beckett, Rice Brooks, Harold Caballeros, Emmanuele Cannistraci, Paul Daniel, Greg Dickow, Naomi Dowdy, John Eckhardt, Michael Fletcher, Bill Hamon, Jim Hodges, John Kelly, Lawrence Kennedy, Lawrence Khong, David Kwang-Shin Kim, Larry Kreider, Alan Langstaff, Roberts Liardon, Dexter Low, Mel Mullen, Alistair Petrie and Eddie Villanueva.

The Role of Spiritual Warfare in the New Apostolic Reformation

The NAR concept of spiritual warfare is central to an understanding of the progress of the NAR.

In a January 2000 CBN interview, Wagner said:

"I believe that the government of the church is finally coming into place and that is what the scripture teaches in Eph 2, that the foundation of the church is apostles and prophets. Previous to ... the 80's and the 90's we practically ignored prophets and apostles and now we're seeing, what I believe is a major reason we're going to new levels in prayer, ... in spiritual warfare, ... in healing and miracles, ... in deliverance of demonic deliverance".

What exactly are these "new levels" in prayer, spiritual warfare, healing, miracles and deliverance revealed to the NAR restored apostles and prophets? They include:

- strategic level warfare (binding principalities over cities and nations),
- spiritual mapping,
- spiritual "stakeouts" (placing anointed wooden stakes with scriptures at key "entry points" to a city to "claim the territory for Christ" and keep demons out),
- prayer walks,
- 24-hour prayer and worship chains,
- identificational repentance.

Spiritual warfare is not a new idea in traditional evangelical/pentecostal belief. But the NAR has given it a new meaning.

In the 1990s, in an effort to evangelise the world before 2000, Wagner proposed that instead of winning souls one by one, entire geographic areas and people groups be targeted by new strategies.

These included "**Strategic Level Spiritual Warfare**", doing battle with the demonic principalities believed to cause entire ethnicities, religions, and geographic areas to resist conversion. After expelling the demons, society is healed. The evangelised population can take "dominion" over local government and culture. The community then experiences a foretaste of "God's Kingdom on earth," including reduced poverty, corruption, disease, and even healing of the environment.

Spiritual mapping is the reconnaissance mission for spiritual warfare. It is the literal mapping of neighbourhoods and cities to determine where the demons are. This includes generational curses, i.e. the things in a city's history that allowed demons to gain a foothold. It is the ideological foundation for "**prayer walking**" and the formation of many city-wide **prayer groups**.

Wagner, George Otis Jr, Ed Silvano, Ted Haggard, John Dawson (YWAM), and others created an entire genre of books, videos and other media promoting these strategies. Access to the interdenominational world missions' movement in the 1990s helped them spread their techniques rapidly around the globe.

This concept of spiritual warfare has spread across the USA and to the ends of the earth.

Wagner has prayer warrior networks in all 50 states, originally called "spiritual warfare networks", then "strategic prayer networks," and now the United States Global Apostolic Prayer Network (USGAPN) together with several other entities under the supervision of leading apostles. Dutch Sheets leads USGAPN.

The *Transformations* Video Series and Transformation Organisations

The *Transformations* video series is produced by George Otis Jr (who is under Wagner) and his Sentinel Group. This series illustrates the use of Wagner's concepts of spiritual mapping. It introduces and promotes prototypes of NAR spiritual warfare techniques and evangelistic methodologies and illustrates the supernatural transformation of a community and the idea of the kingdom of God being established visibly on earth.

The videos feature ethnic communities, cities and nations said to be part of a wave of transformations in advance of the coming of the "Kingdom" on earth. Under restored apostles and prophets, these are transformed by networks of prayer warriors through unity and spiritual warfare leading to Christians taking dominion over territorial governments and communities or entire populations.

The emphasis is not on saving individual souls but on expelling the demons that cause societal ills. Removal of the territorial demons, witches, and generational curses is said to lead to thousands of miraculous AIDS cures, overcoming of crime and corruption, instantaneous purifying of polluted streams and the growth of huge vegetables.

It is believed these results can be repeated worldwide as NAR apostles and prophets bring the "kingdom of God" to earth.

These videos have been seen globally by millions, including mainline Protestant churches and renewal groups. "*Transformations*" has become the buzzword for the evangelisation of entire communities and nations. It has spawned many NAR related transformation entities worldwide modelled on the "*Transformations*" series, attempting to replicate these prototypes in their local communities, e.g. Transformation Associates & Ministries (Otis), Transform World (Luis Bush), International Transformation Network (ITN) (Ed Silvoso & Francis Oda), and Transformations Africa. (The latter, headed by Graham Power, is the parent of the "Global Day of Prayer.")

Locations in the series include Uganda, Fiji, and the cities of Cali, Colombia; Hemet, California; Kiambu, Kenya; and Almolonga, Guatemala. An October 2009 video features the Sao Paulo police force, which Otis claims has spiritually mapped the city.

Transformations networks work closely with political leaders. For instance:

- Lt Gov Aiona of Hawaii has written and spoken for ITN and Hawaii Transformations.
- ITN conferences have included the participation of Ugandan First Lady Janet Museveni.
- President Museveni and numerous other top political, military and religious leaders are featured in several *Transformations* videos. (Silvoso claims that his ITN is "discipling" every region of Uganda and 14,000 churches across that country.)

Transformations videos have played a significant role in the charismatic renewal movements in mainline US Protestant churches. For example, the Anglican renewal movement has extensive ties to George Otis Jr and Alistair Petrie, the Canadian apostle whose role is to bring Episcopalians/Anglicans into charismatic belief.

They have also played a role in attracting S American and other Catholics to charismatic belief and partnership with the NAR and its agendas.

But not everyone involved in the *Transformations* network is aware of the agenda and ideology behind it. Many unsuspecting Protestants and Catholics are drawn into "ecumenical" prayer and fasting movements, pastors' networks and city *Transformations* groups under the domain of the apostles.

Wagner & the Fiasco of the June 2008 Todd Bentley Lakeland Commissioning Ceremony

The June 2008 Lakeland commissioning ceremony of Todd Bentley and the developments/revelations very soon after was a major embarrassment for the top NAR apostles and prophets who attended and effectively endorsed Bentley and Lakeland. Their folly was truly made manifest before millions.

Many problems arose in Wagner's 532 apostle ICA after the fiasco. By the year end, over 150 of his apostles had resigned.

(For fuller details of Bentley, Lakeland, the commissioning fiasco and the aftermath, see Appendix 3.)

Following the fiasco and these problems, it seems the heir apparent to the ICA is the US Apostolic Alliance (USAA), launched in March 2008 and headed by Dutch Sheets. (Sheets is Wagner's personal pastor and deemed third in command after Wagner and heir apparent, Chuck Pierce.) This new Apostolic Network held a gathering in Florida in February 2010 to "carve up" territories for its apostles.

There is no shame. They are still forming networks and setting up hierarchies to rule over the Church.

The show goes on.

A Coming Charismatic Inquisition?

Is it possible that this coming new Magisterium could repeat the Roman Catholic "Inquisition" against dissenters if it gained full ecclesiastical power?

Those not accepting the doctrine of the new Magisterium are commonly bludgeoned by accusations of touching God's anointed, not being in the Spirit of unity, insubordination, pride and coming against God. Those who "test all things" are 'Pharisees.' Any attempt to be both Berean and Pentecostal is answered by remarks such as, "God is so much bigger than His Word", or, "God is offending our minds to reach our hearts". If you cannot agree, you must be silent. We must experience now, and evaluate later.

Critics are attacked in the strongest terms. For example, referring to Dave Hunt's claim (in *The Seduction of Christianity*) that the Charismatic movement has been flooded with heresies, Paulk, Bishop of Atlanta *Harvester Church* and a founding board member of Oral Roberts' *Charismatic Bible Ministries*, asks:

*"Who dares accuse Father Bertolucci of heresy because he honours the Virgin Mary with a reverence which is uncomfortable to many other Christians? Who has been given the right to judge his views of spiritual authority?... **I contend that religious systems are the harlot church.**"*

"That the World May Know"

There must be no challenge to the authority of the coming apostolic government.

But there are different views as to *how* opposition will be dealt with under the new government:

1. Physical force could be used to judge, sentence, and execute penalties (including death). This, however, would require secular government aid and a change of current laws. It is not on the horizon at present, but the Nicolaitan spirit behind the current trend towards a global Protestant Magisterium has not fought shy of this in the past, nor will it do so in the future.
2. God Himself could severely deal directly with, or even strike dead supernaturally, sending deadly plagues on those not submitting to His apostles and prophets of the new wave.
3. Judgement may not come from God directly. With the return of divine government, the power to judge the Church supernaturally will return and the new apostles and prophets will themselves pronounce God's judgement. Sometimes that judgement is described in terms of an army. Some even speak of a civil war in the Church, a conflict between believers; between those who accept the visions, revelations, miracles, signs and wonders of the new government and the carnally-minded who reject them; between followers of the new prophets and apostles (that will change the course of Christianity) and those who use true Christian doctrine but hate the prophetic word, and will not repent. Believers will die at the hands of other Christians. Even if a *physical* application is denied, a strong animosity toward those insisting on Biblical accuracy is conveyed.

There are harsh words for those rejecting the "new thing" and holding onto the old. Strong things are said against those who question and refuse to accept the coming divine government. They are cursed and threatened with God's retribution. (For detailed examples, see Appendix 2.)

The new Protestant priesthood is destroying Protestant Christianity by demanding acceptance of their new Oral Tradition above the Scripture, and of the fleshly (and often demonic) manifestation they call the manifestation of the Spirit.

False prophets, apostles and deceived church leaders are spreading rapidly. Believers are ceding control of the churches to them, no longer holding them accountable to the Word. The laity has been conquered by the clergy. And when the clergy go into error, or apostasy, most of the laity follow. Protesters will, as in the Reformation, have to leave.

But, as in Medieval Catholicism, and among the mainline Protestant State Church Reformation Churches, separation is the greatest sin. The job of the 5-fold ministry is to demolish division, bringing the unity of the faith. As Joyner says in "The Harvest", separating from other believers is a great evil:

*"The Biblical admonition to 'forsake not the assembling' was not just referring to meetings, but the **joining together of the different parts of the body**. The Lord sees only one Church. The Lord's people are going to be freed from the spirit of division which **emphasises differences instead of our common purpose**. A severe judgement is coming upon all who separate instead of join, who are in fact building for themselves instead of for Him. This includes individuals, local churches, as well as denominations and different streams flowing within the Church...Presently the different streams are in the Lord's purpose, but **ultimately all of them will flow together into one river. At that time this river will swell to become an irresistible force before which no other religion, philosophy, or doctrine can stand.**"*

But what is the common purpose and unity of the faith to which they want us to subscribe? The faith once and for all delivered to the saints? No! The common purpose to which Joyner refers is the Latter Rain revival/harvest, the Toronto Blessing, Brownsville, etc. All who refuse to join in *this* common purpose are guilty of the "spirit of division", of "emphasising differences" and are building their own kingdoms not God's.

They claim that to separate is to put our own selfish opinions above the good of the body, and ultimately of the unsaved, since their blessing depends on our visible unity. Separation does to the body of Christ what cancer cells do to the human body:

*"**Failure to integrate into larger structures indicates a tendency towards isolation and therefore reveals an unhealthy condition or malfunction...**The condition expresses itself in many ways: sectarianism, fear, doubt, guilt, selfishness. If a cell turns and rejects the physiological structure of which it is a part; if a person turns and rejects the family of which he is a part; or if a family turns and rejects the community of which it is a part; the rejection indicates an unhealthy condition or some sort of malfunction...Cancer is a biological example.... **Cancerous cells want to live, but refuse to integrate with other cells; they will not function with the whole. They draw life from the body, they multiply, but they will not integrate with others.**"*

Charles Simpson (one of the Fort Lauderdale Five)

"Integrity: Where Unity Begins", New Wine Magazine; June 1983

Pressure to join with other Christians in the grand NAR strategy is increasing. In the past this was a friendly exhortation. Those not involved were not seen as "unhealthy" or "malfunctioning" cancer cells. But friendly exhortation is moving towards authoritarian demand. Those not complying are threatened with God's judgement. They are "Pharisees", "God mockers" and "anti-anointing".

Where will it all lead to?

APPENDIX 1

International Coalition of Apostles: Prominent members

Membership is under the leadership of Wagner, Presiding Apostle at large, Vice Presidents Chuck Pierce and Doris Wagner, and Ambassadorial Apostle John Kelly. The current council providing accountability is Naomi Dowdy, Ed Silvano, Dennis Peacocke, Bill Hamon, Joseph Mattera, Ron Cottle, James Chosa, Dan Juster, Pat Francis, George Bakalov, John Eckhardt, and H Daniel Wilson.

Some key people in the ICA (before Lakeland):

- Apostle Chuck Pierce of Glory Of Zion Ministries International and Global Harvest Ministries
- Apostle & Senior Pastor Dutch Sheets of Springs Harvest Fellowship of Colorado Springs, Fuller Seminary and Dutch Sheets Ministries
- Apostle and Overseer John Eckhardt of Impact Network, Crusaders Ministries in Chicago,
- Apostle, Prophet & Bishop Bill Hamon of Christian International Ministries Network;
- Apostle Jim Laffoon of the International Apostolic Team of Morning Star International;
- Prophetess Cindy Jacobs of Generals Of Intercession and Women Aglow;
- Prophet Mike Bickle formerly of Kansas City Prophets and now of Friends Of The Bridegroom and International House Of Prayer;
- Prophetess Mary Crum of Life Centre Ministries and Christian International Ministries Network
- Sr Pastor Jack Deere, Evangelical Foundation Ministries & Trinity Fellowship Church, Amarillo, TX
- Prophetess & Senior Pastor Barbara Yoder of Shekinah Christian Church of Ann Arbor

Other prominent ICA names (before Lakeland):

- Intercessor Alice Smith of the US Prayer Centre, America's National Prayer Committee, International Reconciliation Coalition and International Spiritual Warfare Network
- Intercessor Doris Wagner, wife of C Peter Wagner, co-founder of Global Harvest Ministries;
- Apostle George Otis, Jr. of The Sentinel Group, producer of the Transformations video series;
- Professor Charles Kraft of Fuller Seminary and Deep Healing Ministries
- Senior Pastor David Cannistraci of Evangel Christian Fellowship
- Eddie Smith founder of the US Prayer Centre, America's National Prayer Committee, the U.S. Lausanne Committee, Mission America, the International Spiritual Warfare Network, the World Prayer Advisory Council, and the International Reconciliation Coalition
- Teacher Ed Silvano founder of Harvest Evangelism and the Lighthouse Movement
- Apostle Dr Belcher member of CFNI Executive Management Cttee, Director of the Institute Emeritus, President of the CFN Alumni Ministers' Fellowship, instructor for The School of Pastoral Ministry
- Senior Pastor Ernest Gentile founding pastor of Christian Community Church in San Jose, CA
- Intercessor Frank Hammond of Children's Bread
- George Barna of Barna Research Group
- Pastor & Intercessor Jill Griffith of Wagner Publications
- Writer Jim Rutz of Open Church Ministries; freelance writer for groups such as, World Vision, Wycliffe, Youth for Christ, Prison Fellowship, Lausanne Committee, Jews for Jesus, & Intervarsity
- Writer Ken Gire of Wagner Publications
- Apostle & Senior Pastor Lawrence Khong of Faith Community Baptist Church in Singapore
- Pastor Linda Rios Brook of Lakeland Foundation and Linda Rios Brook Ministries
- Teacher Lora Allison founder and President of Celebration Ministries
- Senior Pastor Naomi Dowdy Founder/President of Global Leadership Network and the Theological Centre for Asia in Singapore
- Author Quin Sherrer author of Pray For Your Children and Good Night Lord
- Apostle Rich Marshall founding pastor of Springs of Life Fellowship, Sunnyvale, CA
- Senior Pastor Robert Heidler of Glory of Zion Outreach Centre, Shekinah Messianic Ministries, Pray for the Peace of Jerusalem, and Glory of Zion International Ministries
- Senior Pastor Stephen Mansfield of Belmont Church in Nashville, Tennessee
- Pastor Terry Teykl of Aldersgate United Methodist, Houston
- Author Rebecca Wagner Sytsema, Associate Publisher for Wagner Publications
- Pastor David DeBord, Executive Director of The Christian Pastoral Counselling Centre of Pasadena and of Deep Healing Ministries
- Pastor & Author Barbara Wentroble of Wagner Publications
- Senior Pastor Che Ahn of Harvest Rock Church in Pasadena, California, and founder and president of Harvest International Ministries
- Author Stan DeKoven of Wagner Publications and over 20 books and numerous study guides
- Author Hector Torres founder and president of Hispanic International Ministries and Co-ordinator to the Hispanic world for the WPC
- Sr Pastor Michael Fletcher, Manna Church, Fayetteville, NC & founder of ARC Ministries (Assisting Romanian Churches);
- Senior Pastor Larry Jackson of Bethel Outreach International Church in Charlotte, NC.

APPENDIX 2

A Coming Charismatic Inquisition?

Some quotations

There are harsh words for those who reject the authority of the coming government of apostles and prophets, opposing the "new thing" and holding onto the old:

1. Either God will deal directly, even striking dead supernaturally.

*"Don't speak a word against signs and wonders and the prophetic ministry in these last days or
God's zeal will chasten you!"*

Paul Cain,

"The Prophet Christ For the Nations (Dallas: CFN, September 1989), p 5)

*"We are the ones who will choose if the next move of God will be a day of salvation or a day of
judgement - for those who reject it...will have a more severe judgement."*

Paul Cain,

The Word and the Spirit conference, London October 1992

*"The violent will be overcome **by the violent**. My Spirit's wooing is about to cease. **No one** will
grieve me any more. **No one** will quench my spirit any more. **No one** will resist me anymore.
Their days are OVER. Let them know the warm season of grace and mercy will soon be turned to
a chilling winter **of judgement and wrath**; the warm days of my wooing will be exchanged for the
fiery days of my vengeance..."*

Steve Hill

Brownsville, January 1998

2. Or, with the return of divine government, the power to judge the Church supernaturally will return. It will not be by God directly, but through the new apostles and prophets:

*"By the turn of the century, **denominations as we know them will no longer exist...** God will
transcend denominations in the renewal of the apostolic and prophetic ministries to the
Church...When the ministries of the apostle and prophets return throughout the decade of the
90's, **so will the anointed power to judge the Church supernaturally...** We may experience
more judgements like that of Ananias and Sapphira."*

"Spiritual Megatrends"

Earl Paulk

Sometimes the exercise of this apostolic judgement is described in terms of an army.

*"**How is God going to bring judgement on the Church, ? ... with a large and mighty army---**
it's so mighty that there's never been anything like it before. Not even Moses, not even David, not
even Paul. What's going to happen now will transcend what Paul did, what David did, what
Moses did, even though Moses parted the Red Sea. [He then says this army is the 144,000 in
Revelation] See, 144,000 is a multiple of 12. What is 12? **Twelve is the number of the apostles,
apostolic government.** And he says that **before them** a fire devours...what is this fire that
devours. Ex 24:17 says His glory (cloud) was a consuming fire (Deut 4:24, Zeph 3:8). Here is
Yahweh speaking about his coming...The whole world will be consumed by the fire of my jealous
anger...The Lord says I am getting ready to come, and I'm going to consume the whole world by
the fire of my jealous anger. Now what is he jealous for when he comes? He is jealous for his
Son, the Lord Jesus Christ. And **He's coming to the Church right now** and anything that is
**opposed to his Son, anything that tries to take the glory from his Son, anything that beats up
on his children, that beats up on his sheep, that robs or steals or rapes them, anything that
does that, He is coming as a consuming fire and he is going to destroy them.**"*

Marc Dupont, an "in house" prophet of Toronto Vineyard before the Toronto blessing,

"The Next Wave"

Who is Dupont talking about? Who "opposes" Jesus and the revival? Who "robs or steals or rapes" the sheep? The Pharisees, those who judge by Scripture, who won't join the unity programme, the God mockers who won't let go of their "tradition" and resist that "large and mighty army" (the 144,000) of the new "apostolic government."

Jack Deere, who from 1988 to 1992 pastored a Vineyard church, describes this coming army in the context of Ezekiel 9:

"When this army comes, He says it's large and it's mighty. It's so mighty that there's never been anything like it before... 'begin the slaughter and begin it in the temple and begin it with the elders, the leaders of my people.' And they walk through the land and they start and they begin to slaughter and you know it's already started with the biggest names in His household? He has already started the slaughter...and it is coming now among the Church."

Jack Deere, VMI, 1990,

"It Sounds Like the Mother of All Battles," "Joel's Army"

*"When this army comes...everybody will **either submit to** the proclamations of the **sons** of God and submit to the son of God, or they will **harden their hearts** and resist it, and when they (this army) get through, **it will truly be a burnt over field**. It will truly be a burnt over field of God's judgement with either submission or rebellion now made apparent to everyone. Nothing will escape them....When this army prays, the earth is going to tremble. When this army prays, **the earth is going to open up and swallow its adversaries**....the people are going to fall down. People are going to shake and tremble and quake under the power of this army that is coming - people like Saul, carnal Christians, people that are hostile, [i.e., to the Revival] like that army that came to get Jesus in John 18 - those 600 soldiers fell on their faces when he stepped out of those shadows and said "I am HE".*

Jack Deere - Vineyard

"Joel's Army" Audio Tape

*"I, the Lord, have risen up out of My holy habitation. No longer will I sit still in the heavenlies, for it is time for My warriors to arise...**Let the edge [of the sword] be set against every unholy alliance that has come against My word and against the presence of My power and against My purpose**. In the name of the Lord Jesus Christ and under His banner you shall go forth. His banner is the banner of blood. I call you to take the land; **I call you to become the "cutters down" of every altar and every idol and every high place established throughout**."*

Prophecy by Bill Burns

Faith Tabernacles, July 1999

Who is the unholy alliance who comes against the Lord's word, purpose and power (i.e. Toronto, Brownsville and their clones)? Who does Burns refer to when calling for the cutting down of every altar, idol and high place in the land? Not the unsaved.

Sometimes this army is described as Joel's army based on Paul Cain's teaching of the end-time Church as God's army of Joel 2. It was being raised up for the coming revival and would judge the Old Order and bring in the Kingdom.

Rick Joyner approaches the issue from a different angle. He speaks of a vision of a "civil war" in the Church. The blues battle the Grays in an end-time scenario likened to the American Civil war. The new thing is the standard. Those who fight against it are the old order. He issued a call to fight a great war until complete victory. Victory is defined as the complete overthrow of the accuser of the brethren's strongholds in the Church. This seemed to mean those who wished to test the spirits or warn against deception in the charismatic/prophetic/Toronto camp.

In *Morning Star Prophetic Bulletin* (May 1996) he shared his vision.

*"I was shown for the third time that the Church was headed for a "spiritual civil war"...the definition of a complete victory in this war would be the complete overthrow of the accuser of the brethren's strongholds in the Church...**this will, in fact, be one of the most cruel battles the Church has ever faced**. Like every civil war, **it will cause brother to turn against brother** like we may **never have witnessed in the church before**...this battle must be fought. It is an opportunity to drive the Accuser out of the Church, and for the Church then to come into unity that would otherwise be impossible...what is coming **will be dark**. At times Christians almost universally will be loath to even call themselves Christians. Believers and unbelievers alike will*

think it is the end of Christianity as we know it, and it will be, through this the very definition of Christianity will be changed for the better. The Church that emerges from what is coming will be full of unprecedented grace, unprecedented truth, and unprecedented power."

*"What will this coming conflict be over? Like the American Civil War, the coming spiritual civil war will also be between **the Blues and the Grays**. In dreams and visions, **blue often represents heavenly-mindedness** (i.e. the sky is blue), and **grey speaks of those who live by the power of their own minds** (i.e. the brain is often called "grey matter"). This will be a conflict between those **who well may be genuine Christians**, but who live mostly according to their natural minds and human wisdom, and those who follow the Holy Spirit."*

The coming conflict is between believers; between those who accept the visions, revelations, miracles, signs and wonders of the new apostolic government and carnally-minded Christians who reject them.

*"What is the **main point of contention** in this spiritual civil war? Just as in the American Civil War, the **primary purpose** is going to be to **free the slaves** - the spiritual slaves who are being held in bondage by the Grays **who are insisting on Biblical accuracy**. Again, the main point in the impending civil war will be over the institution of slavery - or the institutions of spiritual slavery. When I speak of "institutions of slavery" I am not necessarily speaking of denominations, but rather of any organisation including denominations or movements, that are holding their people in spiritual bondage. The longer we continue to compromise with such institutions, which use manipulation or control for the sake of unity or any other reason, the more it ultimately cost us to remove the cancer from our midst."*

So, the "primary purpose" of the war is to free those held in bondage by those who "insist on Biblical accuracy". These are a "cancer" in the Church, which must be removed.

*"Another cause for the American Civil War was the compulsion for many in the South to simply **"preserve their way of life" or "traditions"**. This will likewise be a cause of many conflicts in the impending spiritual civil war...one of the powers of a religious spirit is to **honour the things that God has done in the past in order for them to justify their opposition to what he is presently doing**...there is a huge portion of the Church held in bondage to the same religious spirit that manifested itself in the Pharisees, and **it will attack any new movement that arises in the church**. The more anointed a new movement is, the more these traditionalists will be threatened by it, and the more vehemently they will attack it."*

According to Joyner, religious "bondage" is anything requiring their revelations be judged against the Word. The carnal minded who oppose the supernatural moving of the Spirit are "traditionalists" only interested in "preserving their way of life. They must be destroyed.

Frangipane describes the combatants in Joyner's civil war as followers of the new prophets and apostles (who will change the course of Christianity) versus those who use true Christian doctrine but hate the prophetic word, and like Jezebel do not want to repent:

"Though this spirit will infiltrate the church, masking its desire for control with true Christian doctrines, it will hide from true repentance... Jezebel hates the prophets, for the prophets speak out against her. The prophets are her worst enemies. When she wars, it is to stir people against the message of the prophetic church. More than the prophets, she hates the word they speak."

Frangipane,
The Jezebel spirit, p.6

Others have seen the same war. Wes Campbell said at the Toronto Vineyard:

*"The Church was gathered in a large civil war-type stately mansion, a big ballroom, and they were dancing. And they were dressed in colourful clothes and happy, and they were moving and they were laughing and they were dancing and they were just having the most wonderful party of their life...Then what happened is that strangely in the ballroom, the crowd began to change. They began to take sides, and they began to have blue coats and grey coats, and in a moment civil war broke out. **A bloody civil war broke out.**"*

Toronto Airport Vineyard pastor James Ryle had a similar vision of civil war in 1994. The South wanted to keep the people enslaved. They wanted their money and bodies to keep the system going. And the North said, 'No! Freedom! Freedom!' There was a terrible fight, and a man's enemies were in his own house.

And the angel said this: **'There won't be a house that escapes weeping.'** We do not know how long this time of visitation will continue.... But when the time is up you run with all your might, because as this begins to be known throughout the entire Christian community of the world, **there will come a polarisation**, there always has come a polarisation. And **there will eventually become wars**. There will be wars in your household. Your own family may not understand what's going on. Your own family may turn against you. That doesn't mean they're evil. That just means as Christians they haven't seen this aspect of the Holy Spirit. 'Cause they're Christians. We're talking about Christians. But the end of the vision was this: That **after the time of bloodshed**, the Lord was going to heal the breach."

So, these men describe a war in which believers die at the hands of other Christians. Even if a physical application is denied, a strong animosity toward those insisting on Biblical accuracy is imparted.

This animosity is clearly seen in the following words of key figures in the present revival (not necessarily formally called apostles). They curse and threaten any who question them with God's judgement.

*"I think God's given up on that old rotten Sanhedrin religious crowd, twice dead, plucked up by the roots. **I think they're damned and on their way to hell and I don't think there's any redemption for them...**the heresy hunters that want to find a little mote of illegal doctrine in some Christian's eye and pluck that little mote out of their eye when they've got the whole forest in their own lives and in their own eyes. **I say to hell with you!** Oh hallelujah. Get out of God's way, quit blocking God's bridges or **God's gonna shoot you if I don't!** I refuse to argue any longer with any of you out there. Don't even call me. If you want to argue doctrine, if you want to straighten out somebody over here, if you want to criticise Ken Copeland for his preaching on faith, or bad mouth Dad Hagin. Get out of my life! I don't even want to talk to you or hear you. **I don't want to see your ugly face!** Get out of my face in Jesus' name."*

Paul Crouch

Co-founder of Trinity Broadcasting Network, the largest US Christian television network
TBN Praise-a-thon 4/2/91

*"God, **we proclaim death to anything or anyone that will lift a hand against this network and this ministry that belongs to You.** God, it is your work, it is your idea, it is your property, it is your airwaves, it is your world, and **we proclaim death to anything that would stand in the way of God's great voice of proclamation to the whole world. In the Name of Jesus...!**"*

Paul Crouch

TBN 11/7/97

*"Somebody's attacking me because of something I'm teaching. Let me tell you something, brother: You watch it!... You know, I've looked for one verse in the Bible—I just can't seem to find it—one verse that says, **'if you don't like 'em kill 'em'**. I really wish I could find it... Sometimes I wish God would give me a Holy Ghost machine gun. **I'd blow your head off!**"*

Benny Hinn;

Quoted by John F MacArthur Jr, Charismatic Chaos, p 14

*"**I place a curse on every man and woman that will stretch his hand against this anointing. I curse that man who dares to speak a word against this ministry.**"*

Benny Hinn

September 1999, TBN.

*"I'm telling you right now **you'll drop dead** if you prohibit what God is doing!"*

Rodney Howard-Browne

Melodyland Christian Centre; 1/17/95

APPENDIX 3

Todd Bentley and Lakeland

Bentley before Lakeland

According to Strom in "True & False Revival" (2008), Bentley was at the forefront of most of the fads like orbs of light, angel visits, jewels and 3rd Heaven experiences that spread through the Prophetic Movement before Lakeland. For example,

- **Angel encounters:** in a 2003 article "Angelic Hosts", Bentley asks for the release of the angels assigned to get him wealth. He also speaks of the appearance to him of an angel called Emma, with a white dress very like Kathryn Kuhlman. He said Bob Jones told him this was the angel that helped birth the whole prophetic movement in Kansas City in 1980. She was putting gold dust on people, and very soon after he had his largest offering ever.
- **3rd heaven experiences:** He said on one trip he visited the small cabin where Paul lived. He told him that on his 3rd heaven visit Abraham had given him information to write Hebrews.

In his website freshfire.com in May 2003 Bentley said his team gave free psychic readings in Seoul, and called it Power Evangelism! He claimed 174 converts through these "God readings" telling them their destinies:

"Hundreds converge on mall floors, not sharing the gospel but doing free God readings (prophecy over unbelievers). There were 174 souls saved in 2 hours. We had our Fresh Fire missions team of 8, and several other friends from the USA on the worship team. We hung up a sign in Korean in the mall: 'Free Spiritual Readings'. We set up 6 tables, with two people and a translator at each. We did it in the food court. We gave prophetic words over the lost for 2 hours, while hundreds of others went throughout the mall praying and gathering the lost. Several of the souls saved were Buddhists."

He also wrote of a coming ministry in Las Vegas, with those trained in the prophetic in "dream interpretation booths"!

Lakeland

On April 2 2008, Bentley was invited by Stephen Strader, pastor of Ignited Church, Lakeland, Florida, to lead a one-week revival. Promoted by God TV, it quickly became a religious and media phenomenon. From a gigantic tent, he preached to up to 10,000 nightly. Services ran for over 100 consecutive nights.

There were reports of fire and burning sensations being felt all over people's bodies. Bentley laid special emphasis on impartation of the "Florida anointing". Churches sent out people to bring back the 'fire', including many from the UK. Many hundreds of leaders sought an impartation to take home. There were many reports of transmission of this anointing across the globe. So, many went home, prayed for others and pushed them to the floor, Bentley-style.

Bentley called Lakeland the greatest Pentecostal outpouring since Azusa Street. The Elijah List claimed it had been revealed to Bob Jones that the "third wave" would come in 2008. (The first was Toronto, the second Pensacola and the third would be a global move of signs and wonders.)

Some Video reports

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=sXnWs7HTvDc>

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=SayZHf61khs&NR=1> Very worrying

<http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=VgbWqmDQfys&feature=related>

June 2008 Commissioning Ceremony

Controversy had been growing over the Lakeland meetings. Wagner, in line with basic NAR ideology, felt one of Bentley's greatest needs was proper spiritual covering or "apostolic alignment." So, on June 23, he

organised a group of "apostles and prophets", including Rick Joyner, Bill Miller, Patricia King, Stephen Strader and Keith Miller, to bestow with individual prophecies the calling of evangelist on Bentley. He asked apostles Che Ahn, Bill Johnson and John Arnott, to lay hands on Bentley and to bring him under the covering of their Revival Alliance apostolic network.

There Wagner as 'head apostle' "decreed" (he did not use the word "prophesied") as follows:

"I take the apostolic authority that God has given me and I decree to Todd Bentley:

- Your power will increase.*
- Your authority will increase.*
- Your favour will increase.*
- Your influence will increase.*
- Your revelation will increase.*

I also decree that:

- A new supernatural strength will flow through this ministry.*
- A new life force will penetrate this move of God*
- God will pour out a higher level of discernment to distinguish truth from error..."*

The next day, Wagner wrote of this "groundbreaking event" - "We are now in a place in what I see as the Second Apostolic Age..." (i.e. a new age of true apostles). He stated,

- Bentley was aligned with 3 apostles of the Revival Alliance who then commissioned him as the evangelist to lead the Lakeland outpouring.
- He was anointed with a "special new 'Be revived' oil from Africa"(!!!) whereupon Bentley fell "under the power of the Spirit" (or rather, spirit!) and the 3 prophesied over him, commissioning him.
- Then most of the backup apostles prayed and prophesied. "The power of the Holy Spirit was so heavy ... you could almost have cut it with a knife."
- The 17 apostles involved represented three distinct apostolic streams, (Wagner's) ICA, Revival Alliance & (Joyner's) MorningStar.
- Bob Jones had prophesied earlier that on 22 June the Lakeland outpouring would increase so much it would seem the revival would really begin at that time. (Bob Jones had proclaimed the Lakeland revival to be, "The Third Wave.")

When prominent apostles and prophets laid hands on and publicly ordained Bentley on a televised commissioning service before multitudes, with decrees, prophecies of going to higher levels, predictions of increasing world-wide influence and leading a world-wide revival, and emphatic and prolific endorsements of his character, it could only be interpreted as an endorsement.

The Fiasco

Yet, despite the predictions of tremendous blessing as a leader of a great, coming revival, within weeks Lakeland unravelled.

In July, ABC Nightline aired a programme on Lakeland. When they asked for three medically verifiable healings, the information given was so patchy and unsubstantiated they announced not a single miracle claim could be verified, despite claims of many healings and even over 20 resurrections. Soon after, Robert Ricciardelli, a Wagner ICA apostle, publicly said there were very few healings and no verified resurrections. He warned of some leaving ICA unless the decision to jump into the Lakeland stream was reconsidered.

Soon after, Bentley's Fresh Fire board released a statement saying he and his wife were separating, apparently over inappropriate relations with a woman staff member.

Those who had stood on that stage were extremely embarrassed. And none more so than Wagner.

On 25 August, Wagner said Bentley was a liar and a deceiver who had indulged in periodic drunkenness, and whose marriage had been torn apart for years by emotional attachment with at least one other female whose contact went beyond hugging and kissing. Close associates had been sworn to secrecy.

Wagner justified the commissioning by saying he was acting to try and resolve the concerns, chaos and confusion over Lakeland, made worse by the daily God TV coverage.

Why did so many flock from around the world to someone with serious credibility issues? Lakeland had been denounced by Biblical Charismatics and Pentecostal moderates. From the first, many questioned Bentley's beliefs and practices. As Lee Grady said:

- They felt uneasy when he said he talked to an angel in his hotel room.
- They sensed something amiss when he wore a T-shirt with a skeleton on it.
- They wondered why a man of God would cover himself with tattoos. (These came after he was saved. He said the angel told him it was OK.)
- They were horrified when one man had his tooth knocked out during prayer.

But discernment was discouraged. *God TV* said, "any criticism of Todd Bentley is demonic". The hosts also warned those listening to criticism of Bentley could lose their healings. Wendy Alec, co-founder of *God TV*, denounced opponents as being of satan, i.e. "This is God. Don't question." Honest inquiry was seen as a sign of weakness. Yet we are to test the spirits. The Bereans were noble because they studied the Scriptures daily "to see whether these things were so" (Acts 17:11).

The Aftermath

The Restoration

Bentley then entered a "process of restoration" led by Rick Joyner (a participant in his commissioning) with Jack Deere, and Bill Johnson.

According to Joyner,

- Bentley experienced burnout leading to deep depression for 18 months in 2005/07, with dislike of Scripture reading, rejection of God and marriage on the brink of divorce. Void of feeling, he fell into extreme carnal behaviour. He became addicted to tattoos, started watching horror movies, and on several occasions got drunk.
- When he started coming out, he wanted to minister all the time. When Lakeland broke out, he went over 120 days without a break. When he went home at night, he was fighting after-meeting depression and his relationship with his wife continued to break down.
- After his depression, he fell to an emotional attachment to a staff member. There was no physical relationship or even physical contact, and she did not return the attraction. But he admitted he would have fallen had she been willing, and so felt he needed to repent as if it had been an affair.
- When he confessed this to his wife, he believes this killed what was left of their relationship.
- After Lakeland and the break-up of his marriage, he fell into deep hopelessness. Many told him he would be out of ministry for years, and some implied it was over.
- When Joyner told him he could be restored, he started coming out.

In November 2008, the Board of Fresh Fire announced he was not submitting to the process.

In March 2009, Joyner announced Bentley had moved to his ministry in North Carolina where he would be involved in a process of restoration aimed at returning him to active ministry.

He also announced Bentley had remarried. In a *Charisma* interview, Joyner refuted adultery claims characterising it as wrong and premature. He aimed to restore Bentley to ministry as quickly as possible, whilst acknowledging many think it wrong to put someone back in the pulpit right after divorcing his wife and marrying the other woman. In an interview with Joyner, his new wife claimed her relationship with Bentley began after he filed for divorce, but she now believed they should have waited six months to a year after the divorce was final before beginning a relationship.

John Paul Jackson, however, one of the Kansas City prophets was more Biblical, quoting Matt. 19:9:

The fact is this—Todd has committed adultery. He planned out and premeditated the divorce from Shonnah. He, immediately after Lakeland, went to Hawaii with Jessa, whom he later married. Subsequently, though Todd is from Canada, he went to Reno, Nevada to get as quick a divorce (six weeks residency) to marry Jessa. In Canada it takes over a year ... Further, that Todd did this while the Lakeland meetings were in process only underscores the deep need Todd has for healing on many levels.

Back in ministry

In January 2010, Joyner announced Bentley was ministering every night at MorningStar, NC, with live TV going world-wide. And there were manifestations similar to Lakeland. Attempts are being made to rebuild his ministry base.

Joyner had been warned very specifically by high-level ministries not to bring him back into the limelight. But he said:

- After nearly 18 months, he felt it time to release him into some limited ministry in his church.
- This did not mean into ministry in general, nor that he is nearing the end of his restoration process. He did not know how long this would be.
- Before being fully released into ministry, he would ask a council of those respected throughout the body of Christ to endorse it.
- He felt led of the Lord to do this. The couple had repented of some of the major issues in great depth. However, he still had issues that could cause problems in the future.
- Strong confirmation came when Bob Jones came to a Sunday service and laid hands on Bentley for his release, breaking off he and MorningStar the negative spoken words of other Christians.

What confidence does all this give us in those like Wagner and Joyner who profess to be at the very top of the new restored second apostolic age, and who expect our submission and obedience? Where will those prepared to endorse ministries like this lead us?

Blind leaders of the blind!